

1 Friday, 7 December 2018

2 (10.06 am)

3 MR WONG CHI CHIU, KOBE (on former affirmation in Punti)

4 Examination by MR PENNICOTT (continued)

5 MR PENNICOTT: Good morning, sir. Good morning, Professor.

6 Apologies for the slight delayed start. I had something  
7 administrative that cropped up right at the last minute  
8 that I had to deal with.

9 Mr Wong, good morning.

10 A. Good morning.

11 Q. When we finished last night, I indicated I had one more  
12 topic to cover with you, and that's what I'm going to do  
13 now. It relates to the retrospective records that you  
14 were involved with, or the preparation of those records  
15 you were involved with, this year.

16 However, the starting point is the internal review  
17 that was carried out by MTR, by Mr Carl Wu, in  
18 January/February 2017. I'd like to go to that review,  
19 please, at B7/4516.

20 Mr Wong, we can see from page 4516 that the review  
21 was to examine the construction records to confirm that  
22 the steel reinforcement and coupler for the EWL track  
23 slab had been installed in accordance with the  
24 requirements of relevant quality assurance and quality  
25 control regimes.

26 We can see from item 2 that you were interviewed for

1 the purposes of the preparation of this report. Do you  
2 recall being interviewed?

3 A. 正確。

4 Q. Did you see a copy of this report back in 2017, early  
5 2017, Mr Wong, after it had been prepared?

6 A. 有見過，不過冇好詳細咁樣睇過。

7 Q. Right. Paragraph 5 of the review on page 4518 deals  
8 with the quality assurance scheme of couplers; do you  
9 see that?

10 A. 係，睇到。

11 Q. And there's a reference to the QSP, and then there's  
12 a reference further down to the key requirements of the  
13 QSP, that is:

14 "Leighton to provide full-time supervision of  
15 mechanical coupler works by a T3;

16 MTR to provide ... 20 per cent supervision of the  
17 splicing assemblies by a T3".

18 I just pause there.

19 Then over the page, at 4519, there's the heading,  
20 "Review of quality assurance and quality control of  
21 steel reinforcement and coupler installation", then  
22 a series of bullet points, and the second bullet point  
23 says:

24 "Leighton's quality control supervisors to carry out  
25 full-time supervision of splicing assemblies on site and  
26 maintain inspection records ..."

1           Then there's a cross-reference to appendix C of the  
2           QSP, and then the third bullet point:

3           "MTR's quality control supervisors to carry out ...  
4           20 per cent supervision of splicing assemblies on site  
5           and maintain records ..."

6           And another cross-reference to appendix C of the  
7           QSP.

8           Mr Wong, I think we're agreed that it's those  
9           records that are referred to there that are missing?

10          A. 正確。

11          Q. In your witness statement, at paragraphs 47 and 48 -- if  
12          you go to that, please; it's B1/432 -- you say:

13                 "During the course of the internal review in 2017,  
14                 Mr James Ho asked me and Mr Jeff Cheung if there were  
15                 any records as per the QSP, including record sheets for  
16                 the coupler installation in the EWL slab. After Mr Ho's  
17                 enquiry, I proceeded to ask Leighton to obtain the  
18                 relevant records, which were not in MTR's possession."

19                 Pausing there, did you make that enquiry of Leighton  
20                 in order to assist Mr Wu in preparing the report, or did  
21                 you make that enquiry after the report had been prepared  
22                 as a follow-up action?

23          A. 呢個係喺胡生嚟做一個internal review嘅時候，佢要求收集其中一份紀  
24          錄，喺佢interview完之後，我本人係會有問過禮頓，去問攞番相關嘅紀錄，  
25          之後有個follow-up action，其實胡生都建議我哋同番禮頓嘅同事去搞清

1 楚番呢份紀錄，之後我都有再問一次禮頓呢份紀錄究竟佢哋有冇準備過嘅。

2 Q. Right.

3 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, could I just get that clear in my head,  
4 and thank you very much. It was put to you that your  
5 obligation under the QSP to conduct a 20 per cent  
6 supervision of splicing and to maintain records, there  
7 was a failure in the sense that the records were not  
8 maintained by you; is that right?

9 A. 或者我講多少少，因為喺東西線層板建築嘅時候，我嘅上司係有指派我繼續  
10 去做嗰個coupler安裝嗰個監控嘅，所以再引申去連續牆嘅時候，呢一份紀  
11 錄係會由contractor準備提供，然後由我哋MTR嘅同事去countersign嘅，  
12 所以應該就嗰個紀錄應該係由contractor準備嘅，所以胡生喺嗰個internal  
13 review嘅時候，我係去問番禮頓擺嘅。

14 CHAIRMAN: So you had joint records, is that -- sorry.

15 MR PENNICOTT: But the point is, is it, Mr Wong, that during  
16 the course of the carrying out of the work and your  
17 inspections, you had no document to countersign at that  
18 point in time?

19 A. 你意思係我每一日做地盤巡查嘅時候有冇文件要簽？地盤巡查make sure地  
20 盤嘅質控保證，應該就係當其時就有嘅。因為我都再強調，因為喺東西線層  
21 板開始嘅時候，我嘅上司就話畀我聽steel fixing嘅inspection係由我  
22 哋嘅ConE team，即係我哋嘅engineer負責，我嘅上司都有特別再指派我  
23 去繼續做一個coupler安裝嘅驗收，當其時所以我係有一個紀錄或者有再進  
24 一步要求禮頓提供嗰個紀錄畀我再countersign，所以我只係會喺routine

1 嘅巡查裏面去確保嗰個質量嘅控制。

2 CHAIRMAN: All right. Sorry, again, I do apologise, but I'm  
3 falling behind again. It strikes me as quite plain.  
4 MTR is to have 20 per cent supervision of the splicing  
5 operations, and to maintain records. Now, question one,  
6 did you maintain records in that regard? You don't have  
7 to explain around it. Answer -- it's quite simple --  
8 you did or you didn't.

9 A. 紀錄嘅相係有影嘅，但係就唔係喺QSP裏面嘅appendix B嗰個模式去記錄。

10 CHAIRMAN: All right. Did anybody else, to your knowledge,  
11 working with you, maintain the sort of records required  
12 by the QSP?

13 A. 喺連續牆嘅時候有，去到東西線層板嘅時候，據我所知，就有。

14 CHAIRMAN: All right. Who maintained the records in respect  
15 of the diaphragm walls?

16 A. 當其時係Intrafor。

17 CHAIRMAN: All right. And you countersigned those records?

18 A. 正確。

19 CHAIRMAN: You're talking now about the actual couplers in  
20 the diaphragm walls, in the cages? Because once the  
21 diaphragm walls were actually embedded, then Intrafor  
22 didn't have anything more to do with it?

23 A. 係，正確。

24 CHAIRMAN: So, once Intrafor were out of the picture, as  
25 I understand it, there were two lots of couplings to be

1           dealt with: the splicing, into the diaphragm wall, and  
2           at the joints, within the slab itself; right?

3       A.    唔好意思，可唔可以重複？

4       CHAIRMAN:  Once the diaphragm walls were properly embedded  
5           and Intrafor were finished, there were two lots of  
6           splicing operations still to be done: into the diaphragm  
7           walls, and within the slab itself, at the joints?

8       A.    正確。

9       CHAIRMAN:  Now, were records, to your knowledge, kept of  
10          either of those two operations, by MTR?

11      A.    地鐵冇，冇嗰個--唔好意思，我補充多少少，地鐵係唔會有創作或者去keep  
12          嗰個QSP裏面嗰個appendix B嘅，因為我喺Intrafor做diaphragm wall  
13          嘅時候，嗰個appendix B係由Intrafor去準備同埋佢哋先去做100%嘅  
14          supervision，由佢哋簽名，之後就到我哋MTR嘅同事去countersign，  
15          喺文件上，...

16      CHAIRMAN:  I understand that.

17      A.    ...我哋就會簽多過20，係，所以引申其實喺我嘅理解，EWL slab  
18          嘅時候，嗰個一份appendix B其實都係由禮頓預備嘅，所以Chairman你  
19          問MTR有冇準備嗰個appendix B呢，係冇嘅。但係我本身自己就有影一啲  
20          相關嘅record photo。

21      CHAIRMAN:  All right.  But Leighton did, and presumably you  
22          had to sign 20 per cent --

23      MR PENNICOTT:  No, Leighton didn't.  That's the point.

24      CHAIRMAN:  I know, but in theory --

1 MR PENNICOTT: Had they done.

2 CHAIRMAN: Yes -- that's what you were meant to do? If you  
3 say Leighton were meant to keep the records, you had  
4 an obligation to be able to do 20 per cent supervision  
5 and to demonstrate that fact by way of records?

6 A. 明白，正確，但係因為去到...

7 CHAIRMAN: So did you do that?

8 A. 因為我有被指派去繼續喺EWL slab進行嗰個coupler安裝嘅驗收。

9 CHAIRMAN: All right. When you were doing it, did you do  
10 that?

11 A. 當我EWL進行期間，我只係喺一個每一日嘅地盤巡查嘅時候係有留意同埋有睇  
12 佢哋嗰個coupler嘅安裝嘅。但係上司就有指派我要去進行呢個formally嘅  
13 inspection，可以話，因為你QSP裏面提及嘅T3係應該被指派嘅，所以喺我  
14 嘅理解，喺連續牆嘅時候我有被指派去驗收豬籠同埋coupler安裝，但係去到  
15 東西線個月台層板我就有被指派去做，所以就冇進行一個formally嘅  
16 inspection。

17 MR PENNICOTT: But you see, Mr Wong, where we've got to is  
18 this. As I understand it, you accept that you carried  
19 out routine surveillance of, amongst other things, the  
20 coupler -- the installation of the rebar into the  
21 couplers, on a routine basis, but kept no records, other  
22 than the photographs; right so far?

23 A. 正確。

24 Q. Mr Louis Kwan has told us that when he did the formal  
25 inspections, consequent upon the RISC forms, he didn't

1 formally inspect the coupler connections. So there is  
2 a question as to who was formally inspecting the rebar  
3 into the coupler installations, and you say, as  
4 I understand it, a T3 was responsible for that type of  
5 inspection.

6 A. 正確。

7 Q. The question is: who are the candidates for that T3  
8 position? Can you identify them? I mean, Mr Kwan was  
9 a T3, as I understand it, but he told us that he wasn't  
10 formally inspecting the couplers on his formal  
11 inspections. So who was doing it?

12 A. 或者我嘅演繹，喺QSP裏面嗰一位T3係應該被指派嘅其中一位T3嘅，因為當  
13 其時我哋嘅同事其實大部分都有T3嘅資歷，其實都要由一個高層次，即係例  
14 如CP佢去直接委派嗰位同事，或者類似喺連續牆嘅時候，我上司，我senior  
15 inspection of works Dick Kung佢有好清晰咁instruct我，指派我  
16 去做一個formal inspection去收豬籠同埋收coupler嘅inspection。  
17 所以喺連續牆嘅時候，我係有睇到嗰個coupler安裝，亦都有去fulfil QSP  
18 嗰20%嘅countersign喺嗰個appendix B嘅record裏面。

19 但係去到呢個東西線嘅月台層板，我嘅上司好清晰話咗畀我聽EWL slab  
20 收鐵--驗收鋼筋就係由我哋嘅engine，由我哋ConE team嘅同事，同時佢都  
21 冇再特別要求我繼續進行嗰個coupler嘅驗收。所以當時，我唔知道我嘅上司  
22 或者嘅senior係咪有其他嘅安排。

23 Q. So your expectation was that you would be doing the  
24 day-to-day routine inspection and surveillance of the



1 coupler connections on the EWL slab, but you believed  
2 that a T3, at some point, presumably later, would carry  
3 out a formal inspection of those connections? That was  
4 your expectation and belief?

5 A. 正確。

6 Q. And, at that stage, assuming that were to happen,  
7 prepare the necessary records, pursuant to the QSP?

8 A. 正確。

9 CHAIRMAN: And the 20 per cent supervision would be recorded  
10 by who?

11 A. 應該由當其時嗰一位T3。

12 CHAIRMAN: All right. So your routine supervision, when you  
13 were doing it, was not part of the 20 per cent  
14 supervision; that was more of a formal type of checking,  
15 is that right, the 20 per cent, and that was to be done  
16 by a T3 officer, and you're not quite sure of the  
17 identities or identity of that or those officers?

18 A. 正確，同意。

19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

20 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Sorry, Mr Wong -- would it have been  
21 possible for a T3 officer to attend the site to do those  
22 inspections without you knowing about it? Would that  
23 have been even possible?

24 A. 有可能。

25 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Without you knowing who he or she

1 was, without you knowing the identity of that T3  
2 officer; would that have been possible, given that you  
3 were on site all the time?

4 A. 或者咁講，當其時喺我哋同事裏面，其實大部分都有T3嘅資歷嘅，佢自己有  
5 冇被佢嘅上司去指派去做呢個coupler安裝QSP裏面嘅T3，我有特別每一位  
6 都去詢問，所以我嘅同事，即係例如關生或者其實幫辦或者再SConE佢哋去  
7 地盤，因為佢哋好多時都會落地盤度自己做一啲巡查嘅，我有再特別問佢佢  
8 嘅巡查目的，所以我係唔知道佢哋--即係假設如果係嗰位被指派嘅同事佢哋  
9 一刻佢係咪做緊嗰個coupler嘅驗收嘅。

10 CHAIRMAN: You see, the difficulty that I have at the moment  
11 is that Mr Louis Kwan, I think, has said that he was  
12 never given the job of formally inspecting the coupler  
13 installations when he was completing the RISC forms;  
14 right? He thought somebody else had been given that  
15 obligation, and I think you're saying, effectively, the  
16 same thing; that you did routine, you did not do  
17 a formal inspection of the coupler installation, because  
18 you also imagine that there was somebody else who was  
19 assigned.

20 Now, who would have been the person responsible for  
21 assigning that T3 officer?

22 A. Chairman, 你意思係邊一位指派嗰位T3?

23 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

24 A. 我相信係CP。

25 CHAIRMAN: And who was the CP?

1 MR PENNICOTT: Jason Wong.

2 A. Jason Wong, 或者T3嘅senior, 或者T5, T5當其時James Ho, 好似係,  
3 唔肯定。

4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

5 MR PENNICOTT: Mr Wong, as we are going to see in a moment,  
6 one of the problems is, as you've said to the Chairman  
7 just a moment ago, the 20 per cent  
8 inspection/supervision should have been done by a T3  
9 officer -- that's what you said in answer to the  
10 Chairman's question just a moment ago -- but we will see  
11 in a moment, won't we, that when it came to prepare the  
12 retrospective records, it was your inspections that were  
13 relied upon to achieve the 20 per cent?

14 A. 係。

15 Q. So that takes us neatly to the next part of the story.  
16 Please could you look at H14/35070.

17 I understand, Mr Wong, this is a document that you  
18 prepared; is that right?

19 A. 正確。

20 Q. And a document you prepared, I believe, in late May or  
21 early June of this year; is that correct?

22 A. 正確。

23 Q. In your witness statement, as I understand it, you say  
24 about this document the following. Sorry, just one  
25 moment.

1           You say at paragraph 54 -- you need to keep that  
2 document to hand, please, if you can:

3           "Mr James Ho later followed up on this issue and  
4 asked if MTR had any internal records of our site  
5 surveillance in respect of the couplers in the EWL slab.  
6 I confirmed that I had conducted routine site  
7 surveillance in respect of more than 50 per cent of the  
8 couplers in the EWL slab, but there were no written  
9 records as such. There was, however, a collection of  
10 site photos of the rebar fixing and coupler installation  
11 works taken during our routine site surveillance of the  
12 EWL slab works."

13           And 55:

14           "Having reviewed those site photos (which had been  
15 uploaded to the SCL project server contemporaneously),  
16 I then compiled an Excel spreadsheet summarising the  
17 dates and locations of the photographs taken."

18           Mr Wong, the document that we're looking at, or we  
19 were just looking at, is this the Excel spreadsheet that  
20 you're referring to in paragraph 55?

21   A.   係，正確。

22   Q.   I don't know if you can be given a hard copy, the bundle  
23 from which this -- can you actually be given the bundle,  
24 sorry. (Handed).

25           I just want to make sure that we don't miss  
26 something here, Mr Wong.

1           The photographs that you say you looked at to assist  
2           you in preparing this spreadsheet -- just look in the  
3           bundle -- can you identify the photographs at all or  
4           not? If it's not immediately apparent, Mr Wong, just  
5           tell us.

6       A.  我有嘅相應該會再比呢度嘅為多嘅。

7       Q.  Yes. You see, I think this is a document -- this is  
8           a photograph somebody has taken of your document. In  
9           fact one of the government officers, as I understand it,  
10          who inspected some documents back in June, took  
11          a photograph of this document. Do you understand?

12      A.  你意思係有一位政府嘅人員影咗一張相係影呢一個summary?

13      Q.  That's my understanding. That's why it looks as it  
14          looks.

15      A.  之後我做嗰個reply statement嘅時候，我先至知道係有一個政府嘅人員  
16          影咗一張咁嘅相嘅，係。

17      Q.  Right. But, in its original form, this document,  
18          Mr Wong, was the spreadsheet accompanied by the  
19          photographs that you looked at?

20      A.  或者咁，我準備完呢一個表之後，我係就咁將呢個表交界何生嘅，James  
21          Ho嘅。

22      Q.  With or without the photographs?

23      A.  應該有，當時應該有。

24      Q.  All right. Did you keep yourself a copy of the sheet,  
25          a hard copy of the sheet that you prepared, together

1 with the photographs, or indeed a soft copy of the  
2 spreadsheet, with the photographs?

3 A. Hard copy就未必有，但係嗰個soft copy就應該喺紅磡1112嘅site  
4 office裏面。

5 Q. Right.

6 Sir, the reason I'm slightly belabouring this point  
7 is that despite the search that we've carried out, this  
8 appears to be the only copy of this document that we  
9 have in the files, and it's obviously been disclosed by  
10 the government as part of an exhibit to one of the  
11 witness statements.

12 We are not aware that it has been disclosed by the  
13 MTRC, with or without the photographs, and that's why  
14 I was just exploring that point with Mr Wong.

15 Now, Mr Wong, just looking at this sheet, it says at  
16 the bottom "more than 60 per cent of the installed  
17 couplers were inspected in the mentioned areas".

18 How does one derive the 60 per cent figure? How  
19 have you calculated the 60 per cent?

20 A. 呢個六成數字應該由嗰個area, by area去分出嚟嘅，即係計嗰個倉數。

21 Q. I'm still not quite there, Mr Wong. What you've listed  
22 there, by reference to a series of dates, are various  
23 areas on the EWL slab, one on the South Approach Tunnel,  
24 and a small number on the NSL, slab I assume that is.  
25 I just don't get, from that information, how you  
26 calculated 60 per cent. And sorry, I should say, some

1 are on the western wall, and I assume but I don't know,  
2 where it doesn't say "western D-wall" it perhaps means  
3 "eastern", but I'm really not sure. Can you explain?

4 A. 我解釋下呢個表，第一行就係講個日子，應該就係嗰張相當其時影嘅日子嚟  
5 嘅，嗰個area，即係個地區，...

6 Q. Right.

7 A. ...就EWL嘅area C，個bay即係嗰個bay number，即係第一行就即  
8 係C1-2嘅，個location就係嗰個bottom layer，即係嗰個底鐵。

9 Q. Right. Pausing there, is that the East Wall or the  
10 West Wall? On the first one, sorry.

11 A. 如果就咁講話嗰個--明白，如果--sorry，你講第一行係邊個第一行？

12 Q. Where it says "C1-2", to the right of that you've got  
13 "bottom layer" under the heading "Location". Is that  
14 the East Wall or the West Wall?

15 A. 呢個應該係包括所有東、西同埋嗰個construction joint嘅。

16 Q. Right. So pause there. If that is right, that the  
17 C1-2, the first item on this list, is the bottom layer  
18 of east, west and construction joints, how many  
19 photographs did you look at to establish that?

20 A. 我要睇番個site office嗰個server嗰度有幾多張相，大概會有五至六張，  
21 我記得就。

22 Q. Right. And the next one down is the EWL slab, area C,  
23 C1-3, but this time specifically the western D-wall?

24 A. 係，呢個西連續牆，應該呢個就係特別指明西連續牆就係因為我哋西邊嘅連

1 續牆嗰個coupler安裝有個垂直嘅安裝，即係我哋琴晚睇過有張相，類似係  
2 後面嗰度有一張相見到一排coupler，呢個如果特別寫明西邊，就即係指佢  
3 垂直西面連續牆嘅coupler。

4 Q. Right. Now, as a general question, where we see "bottom  
5 layer" on this sheet, as per the first item, can we  
6 assume that you're talking about the eastern wall, the  
7 western wall and the construction joints?

8 A. 正確。

9 Q. And so, in order to arrive at the conclusion that all of  
10 these areas constituted more than 60 per cent of the  
11 installed couplers, or areas where the installed  
12 couplers were to be found, presumably you must have  
13 calculated the total number of couplers?

14 A. 同意，但係如果用嗰個by area，即係假設係我有十倉，我完成咗六倉嘅  
15 inspection，咁係其實都係相等於60%，大概喇，呢個係大概嘅。因為當  
16 其時準備呢個summary嘅時候，就個時間就都好緊迫，所以唔能夠好精準  
17 咁樣計到每一粒究竟成個EWL係用咗幾多粒，所以呢個percentage係一個  
18 大概個數量嚟嘅。

19 Q. Right.

20 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, again, but the percentage then of  
21 60 per cent, from what you're telling me, if it was done  
22 by taking the number of bays, might suggest that there  
23 were certain bays which you didn't inspect at all?

24 A. 喺我自己本身自己--我本人影嘅相，有啲係冇影，但係就唔等於當年就有行



1 過同埋冇睇過，因為我有其他同事負責某幾個特定嘅位置。

2 CHAIRMAN: I understand that. It's just you said that the  
3 60 per cent as a rough figure might be done by taking  
4 the number of bays. So, if you had ten bays, on your  
5 basis, you would have inspected, say, six, that would  
6 have given you 60 per cent, but that would have left  
7 four bays where perhaps there was no record of any  
8 inspection?

9 It's probably an overly simplistic question. I'm  
10 just trying to understand how you worked out percentage.

11 A. 嗰個六成係base on我嘅record photo，但係就唔相等於另外嗰四成我係  
12 冇去過或者我有檢查過嘅，因為有時我睇咗，唔一定會有影到相。

13 CHAIRMAN: All right. Then the other final question --  
14 again, it's probably overly simplistic and forgive me --  
15 is how does a photograph prove that you inspected  
16 a particular percentage of the individual couplers?

17 A. 我自己本身影嘅相有啲係好清楚，例如琴日有過一張相睇過，我係拍咗一把  
18 尺去度嗰個thread嗰個長度嘅，呢個就最簡單就一定係check咗嘅，另外有  
19 啲就係我一啲general view或者一啲遠景影咗落去，佢係做緊嗰個安裝或  
20 者佢已經紮好鐵嘅，嗰個其實即係代表咗當其時我去咗現場，我有去望過、  
21 睇過嗰個coupler安裝，因為QSP BOSA畀我哋嘅training其實其中一個係  
22 我哋inspector去睇嗰個組裝合唔合格好著重佢留番1至1.5道牙出嚟嗰個  
23 maximum tolerance，即係最大嗰個容許量，所以好多時...

24 CHAIRMAN: I appreciate all of that. I'm just looking at  
25 accuracy of records, I suppose, and perhaps, because I'm

1 from the age of just writing stuff down, I find it a bit  
2 difficult. I imagine myself, by way of analogy, going  
3 to the front of a renaissance cathedral in Europe and  
4 looking at all the saints, the statues. The fact that  
5 I take a photograph of one statue at the front of that  
6 cathedral doesn't mean that I have necessarily inspected  
7 60 per cent of the statues. Do you see the point I'm  
8 making? And if I then go to my photographic book two  
9 years later and people say, "How many statues did you  
10 look at?", I'd probably have difficulty trying to  
11 remember. And it seems to me, in principle, this is the  
12 same sort of situation, you see.

13 A. 明白嘅，所以我主要其實都係會睇番我哋有影過嘅相，再憑嗰張相，再加埋  
14 平時我同埋我嘅inspector team喺地盤做巡查嘅時間，加埋其實除咗我嘅  
15 證人口供裏面提過嗰五個incident，但係都即時rectify番，我推算，我  
16 係有信心話嗰啲我之前簽嘅record係冇問題嘅，係certify佢係okay嘅，  
17 因為我哋...

18 CHAIRMAN: All right. So you kept, did you, a record each  
19 day of how long you had actually spent on site?

20 A. 或者我講多少少，記錄低喺地盤出入嘅時間，大概，如果以我自己本人為例，  
21 我自己做inspector of works嘅時候，大概有三個輕量嘅文件，我係需要  
22 留喺寫字樓度處理嘅，一樣就係site diary；二，就係progress嘅  
23 summary；三，就係一啲record photo。呢三樣文件其實都base on我每  
24 一日喺地盤度巡查得番嚟嘅資料同record，所以本人嚟講，就好大比重喺個

1 地盤度巡查嘅。

2 以我本人嘅習慣，我嘅正常返工時間係08:30至到16:00，我嘅地盤出  
3 現同埋巡查嘅時間就大概會係09:30直至去到17:00，除咗有一個鐘頭會食  
4 飯之外，所以以我本人為例，都好大篇幅同好長時間會係地盤度做巡查嘅。

5 MR PENNICOTT: All right. Mr Wong, how easy would it be for  
6 you to identify the photographs that you looked at in  
7 preparing this schedule, if I asked you to go and do it  
8 now?

9 A. 如果你要我搵，應該要返番去紅磡個寫字樓嗰度，有個folder，我應該裝起  
10 咗嘅。

11 Q. Right. One reason I ask you that question is this.  
12 I would be interested to know what photographs you  
13 looked at in relation to the last item on this schedule,  
14 the photograph or photographs taken on 11 January 2016,  
15 in relation to the EWL slab, area B, bay 4/5, top layer;  
16 do you see that?

17 A. 我見到。

18 Q. The reason I'm interested in that is that bay 4/5  
19 doesn't have a top layer of rebar, because it has  
20 through-bars and there are no couplers there. Hence my  
21 interest to see the photographs that you looked at.

22 A. 頂層除咗東、西嘅diaphragm wall之外，其實都有個construction  
23 joint嗰個coupler安裝落去，即係其實佢係四個方向都會有機會有，如果  
24 佢東面有，即係其實你face to area C1-5，或者去番area B嘅bay 3

1 佢咪有囉。

2 Q. That's why I'm interested to see the photographs,  
3 precisely what it is you're referring to.

4 So you're saying, as I understand, this has got  
5 nothing to do with the D-walls; this is just to do with  
6 the construction joints, is it?

7 A. 如果你意思東面係完全冇嘅話，佢就應該--即係我其實都好肯定要睇番張  
8 相，一定會就係喺另外嘅area B bay 3，或者去到area C1嘅應該C1-5。

9 Q. I don't doubt what you're telling us, Mr Wong, but the  
10 point is that -- that sort of point illustrates the fact  
11 that unless you've got the photographs and you can  
12 identify what it is you've looked at, it's impossible to  
13 work out, without the photographs, how you've arrived at  
14 that 60 per cent. It's just impossible, because we  
15 don't know whether we're looking at the D-wall east  
16 side, the D-wall west side, the construction joints,  
17 whether it's one side or both sides. We simply don't  
18 know, without the photographs, do we?

19 A. 就係確實係要睇番張相。

20 Q. Well, don't do the exercise unless asked.

21 Can we move on, please. Could I ask you now to go  
22 to page B7 --

23 MR BOULDING: Sir, I hesitate to intervene. I'm just trying  
24 to be helpful. I've just been told that all of the  
25 photographs are in bundle B17, pages 24203 to 24373.

1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

2 MR PENNICOTT: Sorry, is that all the photographs that  
3 relate to this sheet, the spreadsheet?

4 MR BOULDING: That's the understanding of the note I've just  
5 been passed.

6 MR PENNICOTT: All right. So that will be 70-odd  
7 photographs. Let's have a look. B17.

8 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, could I, Mr Wong, just -- we have  
9 discussed this and I don't wish to belabour it, but  
10 would you agree that it's perhaps not the most accurate  
11 system that you've explained to us, for recording things  
12 some time later?

13 A. Chairman, 如果一個十分仔細嘅紀錄, 其實如果係--最好係應該係當時會  
14 準備一定好過做一個retrospective嘅record。

15 CHAIRMAN: But even retrospectively, this is not exactly  
16 high-tech, absolute record-keeping, is it? It's a bit  
17 vague. I don't mean that in a condescending way at all.  
18 I'm just saying, looking at the way you've explained it,  
19 for example, how long you spent on the site in a day,  
20 where you were, things like that, it seems to me that,  
21 at best, what we're looking at is a sort of estimate.  
22 Would you agree with that?

23 A. 同意嘅, Chairman, 但係以我本人嚟計, 當其時喺2018年我去簽番呢個  
24 record嘅時候, 其實我最著重去考慮就係有冇嚴重嘅問題發生咗, 而係冇  
25 去跟進嘅。喺我嘅印象同埋我嘅記憶...

1 CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that, absolutely. Sorry, I may have  
2 interrupted the interpreter.

3 INTERPRETER: We are finished, Mr Chairman.

4 CHAIRMAN: Apparently not. Thank you.

5 MR PENNICOTT: Sir, I'm inclined, if that's the right  
6 reference that Mr Boulding has given to us, to leave it  
7 for re-examination, because I've looked at the first six  
8 photographs, I've looked at the dates, and the dates  
9 don't appear on that schedule. So, as I say, if that's  
10 the right reference, no doubt it can be dealt with in  
11 some other way, but I'm afraid I can't struggle through  
12 all those 70 photographs, trying to match up the dates,  
13 and certainly the first six don't appear on the  
14 schedule.

15 MR BOULDING: Sir, I'm happy to consider that, but I just  
16 point out my understanding is that these are the  
17 photographs which are referred to in paragraph 59 of  
18 Mr Kobe Wong's witness statement on page B435.

19 MR PENNICOTT: I'm happy to ask him the general question of  
20 whether that's right.

21 Mr Wong, I'm going to give you a file containing  
22 some photographs, with dates but without any  
23 annotations, without any indication what area we're in,  
24 and ask you to confirm. (Handed).

25 Do you see that photograph? Flick through them,  
26 Mr Wong, please, if you would.

1 I don't know if you've seen enough yet, Mr Wong, but  
2 the general question is this: are these the photographs  
3 that you looked at to prepare the Excel spreadsheet that  
4 we have been looking at?

5 A. 大概應該係。係，係呢一批喇應該。

6 Q. Right. I'm not going to pursue that any further at this  
7 stage, because there's obviously a huge amount of  
8 information there. There's no indication on the  
9 photographs as to the areas, but obviously Mr Wong  
10 presumably must have been able to work it all out from  
11 the exercise he carried out.

12 Mr Wong, can we move on in time, as it were, because  
13 I think we now need to look at the next document that  
14 you at least signed. Could we please go to B7/4537.

15 We can see that on this page, 4537 -- Mr Wong,  
16 you've signed this document?

17 A. 係，正確。

18 Q. Did you prepare it?

19 A. Prepare應該係Derek Ma，同事--唔係，呢一份應該唔係我prepare嘅。

20 Q. All right. As I understand it, this is essentially  
21 an index, or summary, of the various sheets that follow  
22 this document in the file. If you just flick over the  
23 page, you will see the individual sheets for different  
24 areas. Do you see that? So one starts with A1, A2, and  
25 so forth.

1 A. 係，睇到。

2 Q. Right. You can confirm that that sheet at the front is  
3 essentially a summary or an index of the following  
4 sheets?

5 A. 正確。

6 Q. Mr Ma has explained to us -- that's Derek Ma has  
7 explained to us -- that he received a soft copy of  
8 a template from Leighton, that he modified the document.  
9 Following discussions with Michael Fu he added the  
10 words -- if you look at the first sheet, at 4538, he  
11 added, or rather Mr Ma added, the words:

12 "This form serves a retrospective record of coupler  
13 installation."

14 Do you see that, at the bottom of the page? Do you  
15 see that, Mr Wong?

16 A. 睇到，明白。

17 Q. All right. Then he handed the document to you, but  
18 without any of the manuscript on the documents that we  
19 can see on page, by way of example, 4538.

20 So, pausing there, are the manuscript annotations  
21 that we see on these sheets, from 4538 and onwards,  
22 yours, Mr Wong?

23 A. 正確。

24 Q. Just taking -- let's look at 4539, a slightly better  
25 example. We're in area A2; do you see that, Mr Wong?



1 A. 應該係area A bay 2。

2 Q. Yes, area A, bay 2, yes, that's right.

3 And area A was an area that you were responsible for  
4 inspecting, Mr Wong?

5 A. 正確。

6 Q. You have, we can see, struck through the letters "NS" in  
7 relation to the top rebar and the bottom rebar on this  
8 page?

9 A. 正確。

10 Q. And in making, as it were, that striking-through, what  
11 did you rely upon? What was your thinking? What  
12 allowed you to delete the letters "NS"?

13 A. 我都係睇番我嘅record photo，加埋我其他同事有影嘅相，同埋本身呢一  
14 個區域有發生過任何一啲coupler安裝嘅問題，加上我相信我自己同埋我嘅  
15 同事喺做地盤巡查嘅時候嗰個時間性應該就可以完全cover到佢組裝嘅時候  
16 嘅，所以我好有信心就刪咗個“NS”。

17 Q. Did you also delete items 5 and 6 on page 4539?

18 A. 我唔記得係我劃定係Derek劃嘅，因為喺呢個area A bay 2呢一個位置，  
19 喺item 5同item 6就係從未出現過嘅，所以就直接叔晒佢。

20 Q. All right. Sorry, sir.

21 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I do apologise again. So your handwritten  
22 deletion of "Not satisfactory" then is based on memory,  
23 essentially, is that right, together with the  
24 photographs?

25 A. 正確。

1 CHAIRMAN: Because you're saying, "We didn't remember any  
2 problem with the coupler installation." That's to quote  
3 what you said a couple of minutes ago. So basically,  
4 a lot of these records were based on recollection going  
5 back a good many months?

6 A. 正確。

7 CHAIRMAN: Okay.

8 MR PENNICOTT: Having made the manuscript additions to the  
9 various sheets, Mr Wong, my understanding is that there  
10 was a discussion between yourself and your colleagues,  
11 including Mr Ma, that the document should all be  
12 backdated to 10 February 2017; is that correct?

13 A. 正確。

14 Q. And, in your own words, Mr Wong, what was the thinking  
15 behind that?

16 A. 你意思係嗰個日子嗰個安排?

17 Q. Yes.

18 A. 因為當其時係2018年6月我已經調咗去其他部門property project喇喇，  
19 當其時嘅title 亦都唔係inspector of works，當其時嘅title係site  
20 rep.，site representative。再加上呢個retrospective record，  
21 其實我都第一次接觸，所以我就問番究竟嗰個日子係究竟要寫邊日。而且當  
22 其時我好清楚日子一定唔會係寫番係2015年，因為呢一個係retrospective  
23 record，所以最後得出嘅結論就係2017年呢個2月10號係for回應番我哋內  
24 部嗰個internal review嘅。所以最後嗰個日子係寫咗2017年。

25 Q. So there was an attempt to tie it back to the internal

1 review that we were looking at at the outset this  
2 morning?

3 A. 正確。

4 CHAIRMAN: So would you agree what you were attempting to do  
5 was to make it look as if these documents had been  
6 compiled in February 2017, at or about the time that the  
7 internal review came out?

8 A. 同意。

9 MR PENNICOTT: In paragraph 64 of your witness statement --  
10 but don't lose the sheets -- you say this:

11 "As mentioned earlier, at the time of signing the  
12 checklists, I did not check them in great detail, given  
13 the limited time available. I am now aware that the  
14 coupler checklists are not entirely accurate, as some of  
15 the diaphragm walls covered by the checklists did not in  
16 fact have any couplers in the top layer rebars as  
17 a result of a change in detailing from the use of  
18 couplers to through-bar lapping. Although I was  
19 definitely aware of this change in detailing at the time  
20 of the works, I unfortunately did not notice the  
21 inaccuracies within the checklists when signing them,  
22 until it was instructed to find and collate all site  
23 photos showing construction details of the east  
24 diaphragm wall, and was subsequently told that this was  
25 for the purpose of identifying parts of the diaphragm  
26 wall and cast-in couplers which had been trimmed away."

1           So if we go back to B7 and the sheet at 4561, just  
2           to illustrate the point that you have made, on the sheet  
3           that we see at 4561, it relates to area C1, bay 3; do  
4           you see that? So it's C1-3.

5       A. 見到。

6       Q. On the sheet we see references to T1, T3 and T5.

7       A. 係。

8       Q. Denoting rebar with couplers.

9       A. 係。

10      Q. And in fact there are no couplers in the top part of  
11      C1-3 because through-bars were adopted.

12      A. 事後我哋再仔細咁檢查番個相片，事實係冇嘅。

13      Q. Yes. And so you were showing, on this sheet at least,  
14      having recorded inspections of couplers which you could  
15      not have inspected because they weren't there?

16      A. 我仔細咁樣睇番張相，就知道係實際係冇嘅，因為佢冇出現過，所以呢張  
17      form其實都係時間太倉猝底下，冇仔細檢查，係簽錯咗嘅。

18      Q. So, Mr Wong, just to round this off, having completed  
19      these sheets, as I understand it, you handed them back  
20      to Derek Ma; is that right?

21      A. 正確。

22      MR PENNICOTT: Then, obviously, we know what happened  
23      subsequently.

24           Thank you very much, Mr Wong. I've got no further  
25      questions. Thank you very much.

1 MR TO: No questions from China Technology.

2 MR CHANG: No questions from Leighton.

3 MR CHOW: Mr Chairman, there are some questions from the  
4 government, but I see that we are at 11.23. Perhaps  
5 it's a convenient moment for us to take the morning  
6 break, so that I can start after the break.

7 CHAIRMAN: Yes, certainly. 15 minutes. Thank you.

8 (11.22 am)

9 (A short adjournment)

10 (11.43 am)

11 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I just want to ask one thing, Mr Wong.

12 Over the tea break, just looking back at the records  
13 that you prepared and to which you put your name, would  
14 you agree that, essentially, they were based on fallible  
15 memory and records that were not highly specific?

16 A. 記憶，係憑記憶，但係都唔會話太含糊。

17 CHAIRMAN: All right. Were you quite happy to sign these  
18 records?

19 A. Chairman，你意思滿意嗰個記錄定係...

20 CHAIRMAN: No, my question is quite clear, I think. When  
21 you were asked to sign these template records which  
22 you've been shown, were you happy to do so, and to  
23 backdate them?

24 A. 呢個因為係我上司，即係當其時何先生James Ho嘅要求，因為本身又有提供  
25 過一啲，所以我係...

1 CHAIRMAN: That's a different question. My question is not  
2 who asked you to sign. My question is: were you -- as  
3 an individual, at that moment in time, with the  
4 knowledge that you had of the nature of these records --  
5 you happy to sign them?

6 A. 本人嚟講，冇問題。

7 CHAIRMAN: All right. So you were happy to sign?

8 A. 係嘅。

9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

10 Cross-examination by MR CHOW

11 MR CHOW: Good morning, Mr Wong. My name is Anthony Chow  
12 and I represent the government. The government has some  
13 questions for you in relation to the evidence that you  
14 have given so far.

15 Mr Wong, my first question is that I recall that  
16 this morning you mentioned that you were told by your  
17 superior that the steel fixing work will be inspected by  
18 the construction engineer, and you also told that it is  
19 not your job to look at the couplers installation. Do  
20 you still recall that?

21 A. 係，記得，正確，係。

22 Q. Can you tell us the name of your superior who said this  
23 to you, who was it?

24 A. Dick Kung。

25 Q. Thank you.

1           This morning, when you were asked by Mr Chairman as  
2           to who would be the responsible officer in the position  
3           to appoint the specific T3 to be in charge of the  
4           inspection of the coupling works, and you mentioned two  
5           possible positions. One is the CP; do you recall that?

6           A. 係，冇錯。

7           Q. You also mentioned the name Mr Jason Wong; do you recall  
8           that part of your evidence?

9           A. 係，冇錯。

10          Q. An alternative would be a T5, and at that stage you  
11          mentioned the name James Ho?

12          A. 係，冇錯。

13          Q. We have received evidence from the construction manager,  
14          Mr Kit Chan, who told us that you were the person  
15          supposed to carry out the duty of the quality control  
16          supervisor for inspecting the couplers installation  
17          work.

18                 To be fair to you, may I refer you to that  
19          particular part of the transcript: Day 26, page 105,  
20          line 5, when I asked Mr Chan:

21                 "So you are telling us that for the purpose of the  
22          QSP, the quality control supervisor designated to take  
23          care of the supervision of the ductile couplers  
24          installation was Kobe Wong?

25                 Answer: Yes.

26                 Question: So it's not Derek Ma?

1           Answer: No. Derek Ma is an engineer who's  
2           responsible for rebar checking. The coupler  
3           installation checking, based on the arrangement at that  
4           time, material time, are the inspectors."

5           So our understanding of Mr Kit Chan's evidence is  
6           that, to him, it was quite clear that you were the  
7           person who was supposed to carry out that duty.  
8           Am I right in thinking that, at the time, he never let  
9           you know you should be discharging that duty; is that  
10          correct?

11         A. 正確，佢冇叫過我--冇指派過我去做呢個檢收。

12         Q. For the purpose of the record, can I also refer you to  
13          the site supervision plan, at bundle B6/4081. This is  
14          part of the site supervision plan dated November 2015.  
15          This shows the various personnel under the CP stream,  
16          and Mr Kit Chan, at that point, first of all, was  
17          qualified as a T5 TCP, and at the same time he was also  
18          the CP representative; do you see that?

19         A. 睇到。

20         Q. So, as far as you are concerned, based on what you have  
21          told us this morning, he would have the authority to  
22          appoint the candidate for taking up the position of the  
23          quality control supervisor; is that correct?

24         A. 正確。

25         Q. Now, I would like to move on to the retrospective  
26          records. Can I refer you to paragraph 49 of your



1 statement, at bundle B1, page 433, please. If I may,  
2 I would like to remind you what you have said in those  
3 paragraphs, 49 and 50:

4 "After the first media report in late May 2018  
5 regarding allegations of defective steel works under  
6 contract 1112, various MTRCL members of staff (including  
7 Mr James Ho, Mr Derek Ma, Mr Louis Kwan, Mr Arthur Wang  
8 and myself) began to gather evidence in response to what  
9 has been alleged in the media report, and I assisted  
10 with collecting and collating the relevant site photos  
11 from MTRC's project server. Other than collating and  
12 providing some relevant site photos, I had no  
13 involvement at all in the preparation and drafting of  
14 the MTRC report dated 15 June 2018.

15 Shortly thereafter, in or around early June 2018,  
16 I ran into LCAL's Mr Edward Mok and Ms Mini Lo and  
17 learned that they were preparing the record sheets for  
18 the EWL slab at that time. I naturally asked if they  
19 were willing to sign those record sheets, but they were  
20 adamant that they were not prepared to sign any  
21 retrospective record sheets after the event."

22 May I ask why would you ask them whether they were  
23 willing to sign the retrospective record sheets at that  
24 point?

25 A. 因為呢啲紀錄紙係應該由佢哋簽署先，所以我下意識會問佢個問題佢哋會唔  
26 會簽。

1 Q. So am I right in thinking that, as far as you are  
2 concerned, it wouldn't be right for them to sign on the  
3 record sheets which were prepared retrospectively?

4 A. 你意思--可唔可以問多一次呢?

5 Q. As far as you are concerned, would it be right for  
6 someone to sign on record sheets which were prepared  
7 retrospectively?

8 A. 如果嗰個紀錄係講明係事後一個紀錄，咁係應該冇問題，因為佢話咗畀人聽  
9 嗰個係retrospective，佢冇隱瞞佢係一個retrospective，已經可以  
10 接受嘅。

11 CHAIRMAN: Well, with respect, there was. You yourself have  
12 said that it was dated 2017 in order to give the  
13 appearance that they were made at that time. That's  
14 what you yourself have admitted.

15 A. 明白，但係因為當其時我2018年就個身分已經唔再係inspector of works，  
16 所以我都想徵詢番究竟呢個係retrospective個record嗰個時間係可以寫  
17 幾時，但係我知道嗰個重點係唔可以寫番當時，即係2015年。

18 MR CHOW: Is it your evidence now, so long as it is put on  
19 the face of the document, telling people that this is  
20 a retrospective record, it would be okay for you; is  
21 that right?

22 A. 如果佢係一個後補文件，寫明佢係後補文件，係冇問題。

23 Q. Okay. Now, paragraphs 52 and 53 of your witness  
24 statement, bundle B1, page 433, where you said:

25 "Afterwards, Mr James Ho told me that Leighton had

1 by then retrospectively prepared a set of record sheets  
2 for the EWL slab, although I had not actually seen  
3 a physical copy at the time. He asked me whether I was  
4 willing to countersign those record sheets, and  
5 I vehemently said that I was not willing to do so in  
6 these circumstances when Leighton had failed to keep any  
7 contemporaneous record sheets as required by the QSP.

8 Furthermore, I distinctly remember raising the  
9 concern that I was only a T3 site supervisor for the ELS  
10 [slab], such that I did not consider myself to be the  
11 competent or appropriate person to sign the so-called  
12 record sheets retrospectively prepared and provided by  
13 LCAL."

14 Now, what you said in paragraph 53 is not entirely  
15 clear to me as to your concern. Your concern, am I --  
16 which one is it? You thought it would be wrong to  
17 create inspection records retrospectively, or your  
18 concern is you consider yourself not an appropriate  
19 person or not competent to sign on the record sheet?  
20 Which one is your real concern, the former or the  
21 latter?

22 A. 我關注嘅係我唔係嗰位T3同埋我係冇被指派過去做一個正式嘅檢收。

23 Q. Okay. Perhaps, at this point, can I ask you to go to  
24 look at a document: bundle H14, page 35067.

25 Right. Do you have any -- at the time when Mr James  
26 Ho asked you whether you were prepared to sign on the

1 set of record sheets, did he show you similar document  
2 as we see now on the screen?

3 A. 當時我有睇過。

4 Q. How about the other document, at bundle G12/9883,  
5 please? How about this one?

6 A. 當時都有睇過。

7 Q. So, basically, your conversation -- on that occasion,  
8 Mr James Ho simply asked you whether you were prepared  
9 to sign something called a record sheet, without showing  
10 you what documents he had in mind; is that right?

11 A. 正確。

12 Q. Now, this morning Mr Pennicott has already taken you to  
13 a summary table that you prepared, at bundle H14,  
14 page 35070.

15 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, just before we move on there -- in  
16 an affidavit or an affirmation, you have said that there  
17 was a time when you were very strongly opposed to  
18 signing these record sheets, but this morning, to me,  
19 you have said that in fact, in contemplation, looking  
20 back on everything you have said this morning, and  
21 reassessing the situation, you were happy to sign; is  
22 that right?

23 A. Chairman, 唔好意思, 可唔可以重複一次?

24 CHAIRMAN: All right. In this affirmation, you've said you  
25 were strongly opposed to signing at that time; yes?

1 A. 我明白，我強烈反對簽...

2 CHAIRMAN: You have said to me, after we have debated the  
3 issue for a good period of time this morning, that  
4 looking back on everything, yes, you were happy to sign  
5 at that time.

6 A. Chairman, 我意思係強烈反對簽禮頓提供嗰一份嘅record, 而我係樂意簽  
7 自己嗰一份internal嘅record。

8 CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you. So you thought that these  
9 were Leighton records you were signing?

10 A. 係禮頓嗰一份係我唔會簽嘅, 係。

11 CHAIRMAN: Were you asked to sign the Leighton records?

12 A. 之前何先生曾經提及, 佢問我願唔願意, 我就表咗態我係唔會簽禮頓嘅record。

13 CHAIRMAN: My question is a simple one: were you, at any  
14 time, asked to countersign Leighton records?

15 A. Chairman, 你意思加簽禮頓嘅retrospective record㗎, 定係任何一份  
16 record?

17 CHAIRMAN: No. Please listen to my questions. I do try to  
18 make them simple, and my apologies if I am being  
19 overcomplicated. Were you at any time asked to sign or  
20 countersign Leighton records of a similar kind to the  
21 records which you in fact signed?

22 A. 我唔會簽嘅, 禮頓嘅紀錄, 我係唔會簽。

23 CHAIRMAN: So you were asked to sign, were you, or did you  
24 merely make a statement to that general effect, that if  
25 you were asked you wouldn't?

1 A. 有，有，何生有叫過我簽。

2 MR CHOW: Mr Chairman, actually, in paragraph 52, he  
3 actually mentioned he was asked by Mr James Ho to sign  
4 them.

5 CHAIRMAN: I know. I'm just wanting to see where there's  
6 consistency or not, if you see what I mean.

7 MR CHOW: Sorry.

8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

9 Thank you. Yes, Mr Chow.

10 MR CHOW: Mr Wong, you recognise this document that  
11 Mr Pennicott took you to this morning?

12 A. 係。

13 Q. You yourself prepared this document; correct?

14 A. 係。

15 Q. So everything that we see on this document was, to  
16 a certain extent, typed up by you; is that right?

17 A. 係。

18 Q. At the bottom of the page, it was your signature as  
19 well?

20 A. 係。

21 Q. Now, based on what you have just told us, that so long  
22 as we put on the face of the document telling people  
23 that this is a retrospective record, it will be okay; do  
24 you recall that part of your evidence?

25 A. 係有講過。

1 Q. Do you agree with me that there is no indication on this  
2 document telling people that this document was actually  
3 prepared in early June this year?

4 A. 係，冇錯。

5 Q. And as a matter of fact, this document was prepared by  
6 you not until June this year; correct?

7 A. 係，正確，因為呢個係一個summary嚟嘅。

8 Q. Fair enough.

9 Now, can you tell me why, at that point, in June  
10 2018, a few months earlier, you still put your job title  
11 as IoW?

12 A. 我呢度應該打錯咗。

13 Q. You told this Commission that since November 2015, you  
14 have been promoted to the position of a senior IoW; do  
15 you recall that?

16 A. 正確。

17 Q. Now, if I can refer you to one of the emails that you  
18 issued shortly after you had been promoted --  
19 bundle C12, page 8127 -- on 15 December 2015, when you  
20 talk about the incident of bar cutting.

21 Now, that happened shortly after you had been  
22 promoted. We can see that you have not been slow in  
23 telling people that your new position is senior  
24 inspector of works II-civil; am I correct?

25 A. 你話我有話畀人聽定係話咗畀人聽? Sorry, 因為佢下面個title寫咗

1 "senior inspector of works II" 。

2 Q. Yes, we can all see that.

3 Then can you tell me, once again, after more than  
4 two and a half years you have been promoted to a new  
5 position, you would make a mistake, as you described  
6 earlier, by claiming yourself to be an IoW when you  
7 prepared the summary table, using your title more than  
8 two and a half years ago and during the time when you  
9 were looking after the EWL slab?

10 A. 我相信我製造個summary table嘅時候我係打錯咗，打錯咗我自己個職位。

11 Q. Can you also tell us -- if you can go back to the  
12 summary table that we have just looked at -- bundle H14,  
13 page 35070 -- can you also tell us why you did not date  
14 this document when you signed it?

15 A. 呢一份文件其實係一個撮要，一個summary嚟嘅。一個summary，其實我本  
16 人嘅理解係唔需要寫日子。

17 Q. Let me give you some background of how the government  
18 got to look at this document. This document was shown  
19 to the government inspector in early June this year, to  
20 look at the records, the contemporaneous records, in  
21 relation to the inspection of the couplers installation,  
22 and this document was shown by people in the MTRC office  
23 to the government inspector, and at the same time the  
24 government was informed that in relation to the couplers  
25 installation, it was sensitive at the moment and that's



1           why copies could not be made for the government, and in  
2           those circumstances an inspector took out his phone and  
3           then took a photo, and that is how we got possession of  
4           this document. So this is the background; right? Do  
5           you follow me?

6       A.   得，明白。

7       Q.   At the time when you prepared this summary table, do you  
8           know whether this document would be shown to the  
9           government or not?

10      A.   我唔知道。

11      Q.   This document was prepared by you. Was it under the  
12           instructions from James Ho?

13      A.   係，正確。

14      Q.   What did Mr James Ho tell you when he gave you the  
15           instruction to prepare this summary?

16      A.   佢意思係我哋MTR應該準備番一個internal嘅record。

17      Q.   So do you expect that what you are going to prepare  
18           would be shown to persons other than Mr James Ho?

19      A.   當時唔知道。

20      Q.   Then did you ask Mr James Ho as to what information that  
21           you were supposed to include in the document that he  
22           asked you to prepare?

23      A.   佢冇好仔細咁樣交代嗰份文件應該有啲咩嘢出現，所以我都係基於嗰啲  
24           record photo嗰度，就打番上面呢個表嘅資料上去。

25      Q.   Do you agree with me that, given that it is your concern

1 not to mislead people into believing that this is  
2 a document made contemporaneously, you would have put in  
3 some note on the document to make sure that whoever  
4 would come across this document would not be misled? Do  
5 you agree with me?

6 A. 同意。

7 Q. Now, regarding the supporting documents for compiling  
8 this summary, you refer to a set of photos saved in the  
9 company's server; do you recall that?

10 A. 係，冇錯。

11 Q. Part of the photos, as I understand your evidence this  
12 morning, were taken by you yourself?

13 A. 係，正確。

14 Q. There were also other photos taken by other inspectors  
15 or colleagues of MTRC; is that correct?

16 A. 正確。

17 Q. So, when you prepared this summary, had you exhausted  
18 all the photos available to you in the company's server  
19 for compiling this table?

20 A. 如果淨係講呢一份summary，我淨係睇咗自己嘅相。

21 Q. I see. Can I now -- we will come back to this later on,  
22 but at the moment I would like to refer you to the  
23 checklist that you have signed. Can I just remind you  
24 what you said in paragraph 55 onwards, in relation to  
25 this set of retrospective records.

1           Now, paragraph 55:

2           "Having reviewed those site photos (which had been  
3           uploaded to the SCL project server contemporaneously),  
4           I then compiled an Excel spreadsheet summarising the  
5           dates and locations of the photos taken. A hard copy of  
6           that spreadsheet was provided to Mr James Ho for  
7           consideration, but he considered that the summary was  
8           not sufficiently detailed, and he asked if I was willing  
9           to prepare and sign a more detailed set of records. At  
10          that point, I was assured by Mr Ho that the proposed set  
11          of records would only act as an internal record.  
12          I understood this to mean that it was only for the use  
13          of myself, Mr Ho, Mr Derek Ma, Mr Louis Kwan and  
14          Mr Arthur Wang, and would not be circulated to any other  
15          parties.

16          Thereafter, I understand that Mr James Ho instructed  
17          Mr Derek Ma to prepare a first set of checklists  
18          entitled 'Checklist for on-site assembly of EWL slab to  
19          D-wall/slab couplers', a hard copy of which was printed  
20          out and handed to me at the Hung Hom site office.  
21          During the discussions with Mr Ho and Mr Ma,  
22          I understood from Mr Ma that the checklists prepared by  
23          him covered around 20 per cent of the rebars/couplers  
24          installed on site. Above all, Mr Ma assured me once  
25          again that these checklists would only act as  
26          an internal retrospective record of my recollection not

1 to be circulated to any parties outside our team of  
2 Mr Ho, Mr Ma, Mr Louis Kwan and Mr Arthur Wang.

3 During the same discussions, it was decided that the  
4 checklists should be dated with a date after the  
5 internal review, ie 10 February 2017, as these  
6 checklists were prepared with the intention of  
7 responding to and addressing the recommendations  
8 therein. As far as I was concerned, I was sure that  
9 those checklists could not and should not be dated back  
10 to 2015, as they were merely a retrospective internal  
11 record for the purpose of satisfying myself that we had  
12 carried out sufficient site surveillance in respect of  
13 the coupler installations."

14 Further, in paragraph 59, you said:

15 "Based on my memory of my site surveillance  
16 activities at the time, and having previously reviewed  
17 the site photos taken by myself and other ...  
18 supervisors, I was satisfied that we did carry out more  
19 than enough site surveillance covering the coupler  
20 installation works, and I proceeded to fill in those  
21 checklists. I did not check the numbers or drawings  
22 referred to in the checklists in detail, as Mr Derek Ma  
23 prepared the checklists and I relied on the information  
24 he had incorporated therein. Moreover, I was under the  
25 impression from Mr James Ho that he urgently required  
26 those checklists."

1           Now, may I first ask you what did Mr James Ho say to  
2           you, to give you an impression that he was urgently in  
3           need of that set of checklists? What did he tell you,  
4           insofar as you can recollect?

5       A.   好仔細嗰個對話我就唔記得，嗰一刻佢係儘快需要呢個紀錄。

6       Q.   Did he tell you why he was in need of it urgently?

7       A.   我有問。

8       Q.   All right.

9       CHAIRMAN: Sorry, could I just ask one thing which puzzles  
10       me. You have said in this affirmation that you were  
11       assured that the records were only intended for a very  
12       small group of people who worked with you; correct?

13      A.   正確。

14      CHAIRMAN: If that was the case, and they were purely  
15      internal records, why would anybody have to sign them?  
16      Why would anybody have to date them? They're just  
17      internal records for you and three or four other  
18      co-engineers to be able to assure yourself of whatever  
19      it was you wished to be assured of. Why were you, in  
20      particular, required to sign?

21      A.   呢個係James Ho嘅要求。

22      CHAIRMAN: All right. You didn't think it a bit strange,  
23      especially when you had to date it as well, because it  
24      seems to give a certain formality to documents which  
25      you've said you were assured were only for internal

1 records, to be seen by just four or five people?

2 A. 因為當其時嗰個搜集嘅資料好多，都有太多時間去好仔細去考慮，所以淨係  
3 嗰一刻知道呢一份應該係一個內部嘅文件。

4 CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you.

5 MR CHOW: Now, Mr Wong, in paragraph 57, when you talk  
6 about -- when you try to explain why the document was  
7 backdated to 10 February 2017, you refer to an internal  
8 review and you said the intention was to respond to and  
9 address to the recommendations therein.

10 Now, this is the problem that I have, and with due  
11 respect, I don't quite follow it. What happened, at  
12 that stage, in early -- from the end of May up to early  
13 June, as you and Mr Derek Ma have described what  
14 actually happened, if I may gather, sort of give you  
15 a summary -- it's that at the end of May, there were  
16 widespread reports regarding problems with couplers in  
17 the Hung Hom Station, and because of that, you were  
18 asked by James Ho as to whether you were prepared to  
19 sign on a set of record sheets, which you refused. Do  
20 you recall that?

21 A. 記得，係，正確。

22 Q. Then you refused to do so, you were asked to prepare  
23 a summary sheet by Mr James Ho, you have just told us;  
24 right?

25 A. 正確。

1 Q. And Mr James Ho found that a summary sheet in such form  
2 was not sufficient, and therefore he asked you whether  
3 you are ready to prepare a more detailed set of records.  
4 Do you recall that?

5 A. 正確，正確。

6 Q. Then you have Mr Derek Ma, all of a sudden, prepared  
7 a detailed set of records for you; do you recall that?

8 A. 記得。

9 Q. And asked you to sign; right?

10 A. 係，正確。

11 Q. All right. Then you also mentioned to us that Mr James  
12 Ho somehow gave you the impression he was urgently in  
13 need of that set of documents. Do you recall that?

14 A. 記得。

15 Q. How would a person believe that the purpose of signing  
16 that set of documents was to address a report which was  
17 published more than one and a half years ago, the  
18 internal review report, in such circumstances?

19 A. 你意思相信嗰個2017年嗰個2月10號，係咪？可唔可以再問多次，或者？

20 Q. Given that a serious event happened from the end of May  
21 up to the moment you were asked to sign on a set of  
22 detailed records prepared by Derek Ma, my suggestion is  
23 that a reasonable person would not honestly believe that  
24 the purpose of signing that set of documents was to  
25 address a report that was published more than one and

1 a half years ago. Do you agree with me?

2 A. 因為呢一份紀錄準備嘅時候，我之前都提過，我都已經調離咗project  
3 division，同埋嗰個retrospective record，喺我嘅理解，就一定唔  
4 會寫番2015年嘅，經過一個討論之後，大家都覺得商議咗係2017年2月呢個  
5 日子係比較適合，所以我都更加--都提過，呢一份係一個內部文件，咁樣，  
6 就係喇，就純粹就畀我哋幾位同事去參考嘅啫。

7 Q. Now, this morning, Mr Pennicott also showed you details  
8 of the relevant part of the internal review report; do  
9 you recall that?

10 A. 係，記得。

11 Q. The specific part that has been shown to you includes  
12 a recommendation section; do you recall that?

13 A. 係，記得。

14 Q. If I may call up the same document -- bundle B7,  
15 page 4519 -- now, under section 5.1, "Recommended  
16 follow-up actions", the second bullet point requires you  
17 to:

18 "Confirm the frequency of Leighton and MTRC  
19 supervision were in compliance with the requirement of  
20 the QSP, and were recorded on the record sheet ..."

21 Do you see that?

22 A. 係，見到。

23 Q. Do you agree with me that what is recommended in this  
24 report is to ask you or the MTRC staff to go away and  
25 confirm that proper supervision has been provided and



1           there were records recording the supervision provided?

2           It never asked you to go away and prepare a new set of  
3           records to cover that?

4           A.   唔好意思，可唔可以問多次？

5           CHAIRMAN: I agree, it's a little ambiguous.

6           MR CHOW: All right. Okay. Then I will move on.

7           CHAIRMAN: All right.

8           MR CHOW: Now, earlier, in relation to this recommendation,  
9           you also told us that actually, action was taken at that  
10          time. Somebody went to ask Leighton as to whether they  
11          had kept a contemporaneous record, and they were told by  
12          Leighton that it did not exist; do you recall that?

13          A.   記得。

14          Q.   So action was actually taken in response or in  
15          an attempt to address this particular recommendation set  
16          out in the internal review report; right?

17          A.   係。

18          Q.   At that point, shortly after the report was published?

19          A.   正確。

20          Q.   And upon being informed by Leighton that no such record  
21          existed, the matter was put at rest, at that point, and  
22          no further action was taken by MTRC or your team?

23          A.   係，正確。

24          Q.   Can you think of any justification that all of a sudden,  
25          one and a half years later, in early June 2018, there

1 was a need to prepare a whole set of inspection records  
2 just to address this particular recommendation?

3 A. 當其時嗰個日子嗰個安排其實都係由幾位同事一齊商量，同埋因為嗰個  
4 record嗰個方向其實都係--最主要都係唔會寫番2015年，所以去到  
5 respond, date back番個日子去寫番2017年嘅。

6 CHAIRMAN: No, I think the question is: can you think of any  
7 reason why, in June 2018, when no action had been taken  
8 for over a year or so in respect of the recommendation  
9 in this report, you would then suddenly be asked to  
10 prepare records which apparently were to meet  
11 a recommendation in the report?

12 MR CHOW: Thank you, Mr Chairman.

13 A. 當時冇考慮得太多類似嘅問題。

14 Q. In paragraph 57 of your statement, you actually go on to  
15 say a second reason:

16 "... I was sure that those checklists could not and  
17 should not be dated back to 2015, as they were merely  
18 a retrospective internal record for the purpose of  
19 satisfying [yourself] ..."

20 This is where I would like you to explain to us.  
21 Why would there be a need, after so many years, to put  
22 so much effort in creating this set of documents for the  
23 mere purpose of satisfying yourself?

24 A. 唔好意思，等等，我望一望先。

25 我相信呢一句意思係我清楚呢一個紀錄一定係唔會係寫番2015年，因

1 為呢個係一個retrospective嘅internal嘅--內部嘅文件，所以--同埋  
2 呢個係文件我係建基於我一個--我足夠嘅地盤巡查同埋得出嚟一個滿意嘅效  
3 果，個意思應該係，滿意係滿意嗰個coupler個安裝。

4 Q. Am I right to say that what is more appropriate would  
5 be -- perhaps you can disagree with me; right? -- what  
6 you should have put is "as they were merely  
7 a retrospective internal record for the purpose of  
8 satisfying the government that we had carried out  
9 sufficient site surveillance in respect of the coupler  
10 installations"; would it be more appropriate for you to  
11 put that, as opposed to satisfying yourself?

12 A. 或者咁講，因為呢個紀錄係準備嘅時候，其實係for一個內部嘅文件，我有  
13 預期佢會對外公開或者再畀其他--即係以我自己組員以外嘅人再去參閱嘅。

14 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, could I ask: if you had been told that  
15 they may be used externally, that is perhaps to be  
16 considered by government, what would have been your  
17 reaction, as to the request for you to put your  
18 signature onto these records, that signature, in the  
19 normal course of events, certifying that you saw them as  
20 being accurate and good faith documents?

21 A. 明白，如果係會對外公開畀其他部門，例如政府，我認為係應該由番嗰位合  
22 資格嘅T3人員去簽署。

23 CHAIRMAN: But you didn't know who that was?

24 A. 係，我有問到係邊一位同事負責。

25 MR CHOW: We know that the set of documents that you have

1 signed, the checklist that you have signed and backdated  
2 to 10 February 2017 was subsequently submitted by MTRC  
3 to the government on 15 June 2018, this year. Are you  
4 aware of that fact?

5 A. 我唔知道我嗰份內部文件會attach埋落去嗰個report嗰度。

6 Q. So are you saying that before today you were not aware  
7 of this fact? So I just told you; is that the position?

8 A. 我意思係嗰個6月提交畀政府嗰個報告，到嗰份報告畀政府嘅時候，我係唔知  
9 道嗰一份內部文件會attach埋落去嘅，因為我有參與嗰個報告嗰個draft。

10 Q. At any stage before today, were you aware of the fact  
11 that the documents that you have signed were submitted  
12 to the government?

13 A. 係，知道，喺呢個做呢個調查委員會落證人口供嘅時候知道。

14 Q. Okay. In paragraph 63 of your witness statement, you  
15 mention that at one point you returned to the site  
16 office and you couldn't find the hard copy of the  
17 checklists that you had left on your desk. Do you  
18 recall that? Paragraph 63, page --

19 A. 係，記得，係。

20 Q. Can you tell us what was the purpose of your visit on  
21 15 June this year?

22 A. 都係James Ho要求我返去繼續做一啲資料嘅搜集。

23 Q. And as at that point you realised that the set of  
24 documents you signed disappeared, is that correct, as on  
25 15 June?

1 A. 嗰次我再返去，我係見唔到嗰個正本，即係original copy唔見，一個  
2 scanned copy。

3 Q. Yes. So you realised that on that day; is that right?

4 A. 係。

5 Q. So did you ask Mr James Ho what has become of the  
6 original set of documents that you signed, why it  
7 disappeared?

8 A. 當日應該冇即刻問，因為可能其實佢哋擺咗去睇嘅啫。

9 Q. Right. Let's go to have a detailed look at the  
10 documents that you have signed. Perhaps bundle B7,  
11 page 4555, please.

12 Right. So this is one of the checklists that you  
13 have signed. We see that at the lower part of the  
14 document, there are six items, which suggest to the  
15 reader that those are the items that you have checked in  
16 particular; do you agree with me?

17 A. 同意，但係item 5、6嗰度應該係冇嘅，因為嗰度係叔漏咗應該係。

18 Q. Yes, I know that. Now, do you agree with me that based  
19 on the description of the first four items -- well,  
20 perhaps you can take a look at the description first and  
21 then I will ask my question.

22 A. Okay.

23 Q. All right. Do you agree that on the basis of the  
24 description, it is quite clear that what you were  
25 expected to do is to supervise and look at the coupling

1 installation process?

2 A. 同意。

3 Q. You agree?

4 A. 同意。

5 Q. So am I right to say that you have not supervised or  
6 inspected such process for all the coupling installation  
7 works?

8 A. 或者我喺度講多少少點樣可以一次過睇晒呢四個item，佢第一個係講嗰個  
9 “coupler fully screwed & fitted”，其實即係佢講嗰個coupler  
10 係裝嵌好喺一個絞牙鐵上面。跟住第二同第三個係指嗰個thread，一個就  
11 係指coupler裏面，一個指就係鋼筋嗰個thread嘅，最後嗰個就係成功安  
12 裝嘅。

13 其實喺我哋一個每一日嘅site surveillance裏面，即係每一日地盤  
14 嘅巡查，其實我只係好簡單企喺一個唔係好遠嘅距離，可能我同你呢個距離，  
15 其實我去睇番嗰個紮鐵嘅工人，只要佢係喺一個位置擺一條鐵出嚟，因為  
16 BOSA出廠佢嗰個threaded bar，喺個end，佢會落一個plastic cap，  
17 即係一個膠嘅保護，大部分係紅色嘅。我會見到嗰個工人擺嗰條鐵出嚟，佢  
18 去整爛嗰個保護罩，即係第一樣嘢就已經合乎咗佢嗰個第三個，嗰個絞牙係  
19 嗰啲牙喺鋼筋上面冇問題嘅。繼而嗰個工人，通常係一或者兩個，即係最少  
20 有兩個，基本上，因為嗰條鋼筋都有特定嘅長度，metre八、兩metre，一  
21 個工人其實做唔到裝嵌嘅。

22 就嗰個工人就會擺一條--除去咗嗰個塑膠保護嘅鋼筋，佢就會去進行  
23 嗰個安裝，一位工人會喺個前端，另一位工人喺個後端，即係嗰條鋼筋，我

1 意思，就扶住嗰條鋼筋，因為條鋼筋嘅重量都幾重嘅，因為你要對啱，即係  
2 假設一個例子，大家擰一個膠樽嗰個蓋，其實你擰入去，追到個牙，其實你  
3 唔需要話好專注望住佢，其實已經扭咗入去。扭咗入去嘅意思即係代表嗰個  
4 膠樽個蓋係個牙係乾淨，你個膠樽嗰個紋係冇問題，你先成功安裝。

5 喺呢個時間，我就觀摩住，睇住嗰兩位紮鐵工人成功咁樣安裝完，成條  
6 鐵裝咗落去嗰個coupler裏面，繼而咁樣--同時間，我都會去計算大概兩個  
7 工人裝嵌一個絞牙鐵大概嘅時間，繼而其實我就可以推算到佢每一個浸數佢  
8 有幾多支、佢大概需要嘅時間要幾耐，繼而喺佢安裝完成之後，佢離開咗嗰  
9 個位置，我先至再行埋去做一個visual inspection，即係最後item 4  
10 呢個項目。

11 Refer番下面嘅footnote，佢係要maximum最多露1至1.5道牙。嗰  
12 一刻我就係去睇番佢露出嚟嘅thread 會唔會多過1.5道牙。如果呢兩個情  
13 況喺我嘅觀察裏面都有問題，其實已經我可以好信心咁樣話畀大家聽呢四個  
14 item都係satisfactory，係冇問題，係滿意㗎喇。

15 Q. Mr Wong, believe it or not, I knew you were going to say  
16 that, but I'm not going to investigate with you at this  
17 stage. I will come back to it.

18 But you haven't answered my question. My question  
19 was you have not supervised the coupling installation  
20 work for all the couplers in the EWL slab. Can you give  
21 a simple answer to that? You have not?

22 A. 100%係冇，同埋係唔需要嘅。我哋地鐵如果你話喺QSP佢要求20或者50%，  
23 我相信我哋--我同埋我自己嘅團隊係絕對可以滿足到呢個要求。實際上，唔  
24 會做到或者冇做到100%，呢樣嘢我係可以確認嘅。

1 Q. Okay. That's enough for my question. What I'm trying  
2 to get at is -- sorry.

3 Do you recall that at one stage you signed on  
4 a number of checklists which you considered represent  
5 20 per cent of the total number of couplers, and later  
6 on, when your team realised that 20 per cent was just  
7 not good enough because the EWL slab required  
8 50 per cent, then you signed a further checklist? Do  
9 you recall that process?

10 A. 我記得。

11 Q. And those checklists were not prepared by you, they were  
12 prepared by Derek Ma; is that correct?

13 A. 正確。

14 Q. Now, if you have not inspected 100 per cent of all the  
15 couplers, how can you be sure there's no checklists  
16 which are location-specific, prepared by Mr Derek Ma,  
17 were the locations that you actually inspected?

18 A. 因為睇番啲啲紀錄, record photo, 因為馬生喺準備呢個紀錄之前亦都有  
19 同我溝通過, 我就大概畀咗個方向畀佢, base on我同埋我嘅inspector嘅  
20 團隊所有影過嘅record photo, 都係可以cover到我之前簽啲50%, 即係  
21 大家睇呢一個internal record。

22 Q. While we are on this checklist, you mentioned to us that  
23 this checklist was actually prepared by Derek Ma, and --  
24 do you recall that?

25 A. 記得。



1 Q. Can you give us an explanation why Mr Derek Ma made the  
2 same mistake as you did, by referring to you as an IoW,  
3 instead of a senior IoW?

4 A. 因為當其時嗰個時間好倉猝，同埋太過趕，所以冇太過專注嗰個title嗰度  
5 打錯咗。

6 Q. So you are suggesting that two separate persons making  
7 the same inadvertent mistake was a coincidence?

8 A. 我同意。

9 Q. Do you agree with me that that would give an impression  
10 to people reading your report that those are at least  
11 documents prepared close to the time when the works were  
12 carried out when you were an inspector of works?

13 A. 所以呢個係一個retrospective record。

14 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, what rank did you hold in February 2017?

15 A. A senior inspector of works II.

16 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, you've said that you backdated it to  
17 2017 to give the impression that that's when it was  
18 prepared, as a retrospective document at that time, and  
19 would it not follow that you would then give the rank  
20 that you had at that time?

21 A. 同意，所以我意思係嗰度寫錯咗，如果2017年，我係應該寫番“senior  
22 inspector of works II”。

23 CHAIRMAN: All right.

24 MR CHOW: Now, I would like to look at another summary sheet  
25 that you prepared. Actually, we have already looked at

1           it this morning. I wonder whether we can put the two  
2           documents side by side. The first one is the first  
3           version of the summary sheet, bundle H14, page 35070.

4           While we keep this document on the screen, if we can  
5           then call up another document, at bundle B7, page 4537.

6           These two documents we have looked at already this  
7           morning. The one on the left, if we can scroll down to  
8           the bottom, again, this document was not dated by you  
9           when you signed, and again your position was somehow  
10          wrongly described. So this is again a coincidence;  
11          right, is that your evidence?

12        A.   因為呢一份--即係螢光幕嘅右手邊嗰一份，嗰份係最早期出現嘅，我相信  
13        Derek Ma馬生佢就攞住呢一份去準備之後螢光幕左手面嗰份，所以佢就誤  
14        會咗我嗰個title當其時係IoW，同埋我去到簽嘅時候，我都有好太在意嗰  
15        個title究竟寫咗IoW定SIoW，所以嗰度成沓都係錯咗，我又冇即時去糾正  
16        番。

17        Q.   Mr Wong, I want to ensure that I clearly hear what you  
18        said. You said Mr Derek Ma has mistaken your position  
19        even in June this year. Is that your evidence just now?

20        A.   佢係有冇搞錯個職位？咁要問番佢先知。

21        Q.   Well, this -- I thought that's what your answer was just  
22        now.

23        A.   唔係，因為大家準備呢啲文件嘅時候嗰個時間好倉猝，佢可能有太仔細去研  
24        究同埋有冇地方出錯。

25        Q.   Now, if we compare the entries in these two summary

1 sheets -- now, the one on the right is an earlier  
2 version -- or perhaps I should ask you: is the one on  
3 the right an earlier version of the other summary sheet  
4 on the left?

5 A. 係，冇錯。右手邊嗰個係早期嘅。

6 Q. Right. Now, first of all, what we have noticed from the  
7 earlier version is that, first of all, some of the dates  
8 were wrong. For example, for area C1, bay 3, you  
9 indicated that the date of your couplers inspection was  
10 on 4 August 2015; do you see that?

11 A. 見到。

12 Q. If we look at the layout plan where we have set out all  
13 the dates of concreting -- I understand, Mr Chairman and  
14 Professor, you got a hard copy of that document  
15 yesterday. Yes.

16 Do you have a hard copy of the layout plan?

17 Could Mr Wong be given a copy, please. (Handed).

18 According to the hard copy of the document 24199,  
19 the rebar fixing works for C1, bay 3, did not commence  
20 until 22 August 2015?

21 A. 係，睇到。

22 Q. Right. This is one of the entries in your earlier  
23 version of the summary which is apparently wrong; do you  
24 see that? Do you agree?

25 A. 呢個撮要表嗰個日期係其實就係嗰張相嘅日期嚟嘅，嗰張相嘅日期，西面嗰

1 個連續牆，我有機會其實係西面嘅連續牆嗰個coupler安裝開始咗，但係喺  
2 呢個summary table裏面，C1-3佢正式開始紮係8月22號，其實有個機會  
3 就係佢做咗西面個coupler嘅安裝，但係未開始做正式佢嗰個底浸紮鐵嗰個  
4 開始，所以佢呢個日子同嗰個日子係唔夾。或者大家其實可以睇番8月4號嗰  
5 張相其實就會明白，即係佢唔係一定要8月4號紮完，咁佢就連續咁去做，佢  
6 有機會可能擺低咗，冇繼續開始正式進行嗰個rebar fixing，所以就有呢  
7 個時間性有個錯配，令到大家誤會咗係有問題。

8 MR BOULDING: Sir, if you want to look at the photo, I'm  
9 told it's at B24216.

10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

11 MR CHOW: Yes, Mr Wong. What can we see from this photo,  
12 which shows the commencement of the reinforcement for  
13 the slab?

14 A. 呢張相，係咪大家睇緊呢張？Okay。呢張相，好明顯呢個係西面嘅連續牆嚟  
15 嘅，因為你睇後面，會有一幅白色嘅，嗰個係waterproofing membrane，  
16 係嗰幅防水嚟嘅，因為呢個防水只係西面連續牆先會出現。

17 而且大家睇到嗰個垂直嗰個coupler安裝，喺我嗰個summary，嗰個  
18 8月4號應該正正就係講呢張，佢都個location都係寫咗西面嘅diaphragm  
19 wall，所以實際佢係開始咗安裝。大家睇番張相嘅底部，你見到有幾排嘅  
20 coupler，其實仲有個紅色，就係剛才我提過一個塑膠嘅保護罩，不過呢個  
21 係保護嗰個coupler嘅。正正就係好明顯佢8月4號佢係未開始做底浸嘅紮鐵  
22 工程嘅，所以喺嗰個大家手揸嗰個紮鐵開始嗰個日子佢係寫咗8月22號，所以  
23 大家有一個誤解係8月4號佢未開始紮，不過其實佢已經準備緊紮嗰個西面連

1 續牆嘅直身鐵嘅安裝，sorry，直身鐵嘅coupler安裝。

2 Q. Mr Wong, are you saying that the way we should read your  
3 summary table, when you put an entry of 4 August 2015  
4 for bay C1-3, it should not be interpreted as the date  
5 when you carry out the couplers installation check for  
6 the slab, but simply the couplers on the west diaphragm  
7 wall has been exposed; is that right? Is that how we  
8 should read your summary table?

9 A. 其實我再形容多一次，因為呢張相，你見到一個好新淨嘅鋼筋同埋嗰個  
10 coupler，其實呢一個係已經係屬於東西線月台層板嘅結構裏面嚟㗎喇，  
11 所以我嗰個location我好標明寫咗“western diaphragm wall”，  
12 但係其實因為嗰個位置係western diaphragm wall，但係其實佢都係  
13 for EWL slab嘅。

14 Q. Can I ask one more question before the lunch break. So  
15 4 August, the second entry in the summary table,  
16 4 August 2015, you put this date for that area was based  
17 on the photo that we are looking at; is that right?

18 A. 正確。

19 Q. So 4 August 2015 is not the date when you carried out  
20 the alleged inspection of the couplers connection works  
21 between the reinforcement of the slab and the diaphragm  
22 wall. So it's not the date when you carried out the  
23 inspection; is that right?

24 A. 唔好意思，可唔可以重複個問題？

25 Q. What we see from this photo are just exposed couplers,

1 exposed horizontal couplers, on the diaphragm wall; is  
2 that right?

3 A. 我明白，明白，唔係呀，因為...

4 Q. Let's --

5 A. 係咪要我繼續解釋，定係...

6 Q. Yes, please.

7 A. 呢個summary 8月4號呢一張相，我係睇咗EWL slab層板，western  
8 diaphragm wall vertical垂直鋼筋嘅安裝，並唔係由大家最concern  
9 嗰個底浸，即係張相右下角嗰幾粒，唔係嗰個底浸，係western D-wall  
10 vertical，垂直嘅，垂直嘅呢個，垂直嘅，呢個係西面嘅，西面嘅，西面  
11 同東面嗰個detail唔一樣。

12 Q. Oh, sorry, that must be my fault --

13 A. 唔緊要，唔緊要。

14 Q. -- because for the second entry --

15 A. 有所謂，有所謂，係好複雜嘅，呢個係。

16 Q. -- what you put under the location is the western  
17 diaphragm wall.

18 A. 係呀，係呀。

19 MR CHOW: It's my fault, sorry.

20 Mr Chairman, perhaps it's a convenient moment for  
21 the lunch break.

22 CHAIRMAN: Yes, certainly. Thank you. 2.15. Thank you.

23 (1.03 pm)

24 (The luncheon adjournment)

25 (2.21 pm)

1 MR CHOW: Good afternoon, Mr Wong.

2 A. Good afternoon.

3 Q. Before the lunch break, we were looking at the two  
4 versions of summary table that have been produced.

5 Can I have the two versions put back on the screen,  
6 side by side, please. Bundle H14, page 35070, and the  
7 next one is bundle B7, page 4537, please.

8 Mr Wong, the version on the left is an earlier  
9 version that you compiled yourself; right?

10 A. 正確。

11 Q. And the one on the right was compiled by Mr Derek Ma;  
12 correct?

13 A. 正確。

14 Q. For compiling the second version, before Derek Ma  
15 produced this table, have you had any input into the  
16 compilation of this second version?

17 A. 提供過一啲record photo。

18 Q. The photos that you now mention, were they not the same  
19 set of photos that you referred to earlier, when we  
20 talked about the first version -- it's the same set of  
21 photos that you relied on in producing the first summary  
22 table; is that right?

23 A. 做第一個版本嘅時候，嗰啲record photo全部都係我自己影嘅；當第二個  
24 版本嘅時候，就係包括我自己同埋我其他inspector嘅同事。

25 Q. Okay. Now, this morning my learned friend Mr Boulding

1 informed or indicated to us that the set of relevant  
2 photos can be found at bundle B17 from page 24303 to  
3 24373. So the set of photos comprising more than --  
4 well, roughly 70 photos are the full set of photos that  
5 Mr Derek Ma relied on in producing the second summary  
6 table; is that right?

7 A. 正確。

8 Q. Before I move on to another topic, I'm just trying to  
9 understand some of the entries in the second version.

10 If we take area C1, bay 2 as an example, if we look  
11 at the version on the left, C1, bay 2, the first entry  
12 shows the date of inspection of the bottom layer of the  
13 EWL slab on 3 August 2015; is that right?

14 A. 正確。

15 Q. And the third entry on the same table shows a date of  
16 inspection of the top mat of the same day, right, on  
17 14 August 2015?

18 A. 正確。

19 Q. But if you look at the second table on the right, for  
20 the same area, C1-2 -- now, Mr Derek Ma, looking at the  
21 set of photos, produced two different dates, 7 August  
22 2015 and 13 August 2015. Can you explain why there was  
23 such a change on the dates, when both of you were  
24 supposed to be working on the same set of photos?

25 A. 因為第一個版本，即係螢光幕左手邊嗰啲相係我自己影嘅，因為去到Derek



1 Ma佢準備嗰個table，佢啲相就相信都係有8月7號嘅，可能加插咗我其他  
2 同事影嘅相落去，所以個日子兩個你睇到係有分別嘅。因為佢嗰個睇嘅時間  
3 其實都唔一定係嗰一日嘅，不過其實都係睇同一樣嘢嘅啫。

4 Q. Perhaps if we look at another area, area C2, bay 3. In  
5 the earlier version, for this area, C2-3, which is about  
6 the ninth entry, shows the bottom layer on 14 September,  
7 and then further down, about the sixth entry from the  
8 bottom -- no, that one is for western diaphragm wall.  
9 So there is only one entry showing the inspection date  
10 of the bottom layer on 14 September.

11 If we now look at the later version for the same  
12 area, C2-3, so now it's indicated in the later version  
13 as on 29 September. So are you saying that Mr Derek Ma  
14 works on -- while going through the set of photos,  
15 realised that the dates that you had put were probably  
16 incorrect, and therefore he inserted a new date? Is  
17 that what you reckon to be the case?

18 A. 日子嗰度就唔會唔正確嘅，因為第一個版本，即係螢光幕左手邊嗰個，嗰啲  
19 日子其實都係base on我哋嘅record photo，例如C2-3，大家睇9月14號，  
20 就係應該有一張相係9月14號，就睇到我係睇咗嗰個C2-3個bottom layer  
21 嘅，而馬生佢另外可能再睇到第二張相係9月29號，要--你就係可唔可以望一  
22 望佢嗰張C3--唔好意思，...

23 CHAIRMAN: Sorry to interrupt. Weren't these meant to be  
24 photographs of inspections, or have I got that wrong?

25 Sorry, Mr Chow --

1 MR CHOW: I think this question has never been asked.

2 The set of photos that you are now telling us you  
3 relied on showed the time of inspection of the couplers  
4 at those locations?

5 A. 正確。

6 CHAIRMAN: Well, on that basis, are you saying that there  
7 were two different inspections? Because the one  
8 photograph shows an inspection on one date and the other  
9 photograph shows an inspection some considerable time  
10 later; would that be right?

11 A. 有可能，因為我檢查完嘅時候，我同事都會同時間都會做檢查嘅。

12 CHAIRMAN: Yes, but C2-3, as far as I can see, you've got  
13 14 September and then the 29th; is that right?

14 MR CHOW: Yes.

15 CHAIRMAN: So you've got inspections quite different in  
16 time.

17 A. 嗰個時間性係base on佢紮鐵，即係佢鋼筋安裝同埋紮鐵嗰個時間嘅，如  
18 果佢C2-3係需要紮二十日，我哋應該就係每一日都會有人去做嗰個site  
19 surveillance，同時都會有人影相，即係同時都有人會去睇番嗰個  
20 coupler嘅安裝，所以其實唔會係一日。而且大家知道嗰個bottom mat  
21 係有好多個layer嘅，喺一日裏面唔會做得晒。

22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. I appreciate that. In  
23 which case, we are obviously at odds then. What you are  
24 saying to me is that these photographs are not of  
25 a particular inspection date, a formal inspection; they

1 are just of the work as it progresses. That must be the  
2 case then; is that right?

3 A. 同意。

4 CHAIRMAN: Okay. So what were these documents being held  
5 out as? On this basis, this document is a summary of  
6 shots of work in progress; that's right, isn't it? Not  
7 of any particular special inspection time, for example  
8 when the RISC document was asked for, but just shots of  
9 work in progress?

10 A. 同意。

11 CHAIRMAN: All right.

12 A. 因為我哋呢個coupler安裝係base on個site surveillance。

13 CHAIRMAN: Okay. So if one photograph is two weeks ahead of  
14 another one, then presumably the coupling of reinforced  
15 bars into the couplers would have been at different  
16 stages too?

17 A. 正確，因為佢...

18 CHAIRMAN: So if you say this is a checklist to confirm that  
19 they've all been properly installed, that can't be  
20 right, because one set may show it when it's only just  
21 started the installation process; another may show it  
22 later. In other words, they are shots of work in  
23 progress. They are not confirmations of the completion  
24 of work satisfactorily. That must follow, mustn't it?

25 A. 因為我哋每一日嘅地盤巡查都會確保嗰個質量嗰個監控，所以每一日嗰個地

1 盤巡查，我哋都係會確保嗰個--例如講番呢個coupler安裝，都會確保番佢  
2 個安裝係滿意嘅，雖然佢有一個好official嘅inspection。

3 CHAIRMAN: All right. Please forgive me. I know I sound as  
4 if I'm labouring all this, but I'm obviously just not  
5 smart enough to really follow this, but if you've got  
6 a checklist, the coupler installation in bay C1-2 has  
7 been dealt with correctly, then you can't have one  
8 photograph taken one week and another taken three weeks  
9 later, because by then, either in the beginning or the  
10 end, it's all covered with concrete, or the work hasn't  
11 been completed. Do you see what I mean?

12 A. 我明白，Chairman，因為steel fixing紮鐵呢個工序佢其實都係一個時段  
13 裏面先至能夠完成，就算係喺一個bottom mat，佢要完成都要一個禮拜或者  
14 兩個禮拜，所以喺我哋喺呢兩個禮拜期間，我哋係會每一日喺巡查裏面都會睇  
15 番佢嗰個coupler嘅安裝符唔符合規格嘅，所以base on嗰啲相，其實睇嘅日  
16 子係會有唔同嘅，因為佢每一日都發生，我哋每一日都會去睇，每一日都會巡  
17 查。

18 CHAIRMAN: All right. So what you're saying, for example,  
19 then is one photograph may look at the bottom layer or  
20 the bottom mat, another at another date may look the top  
21 mat?

22 A. 係。

23 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: If I can just take that one step  
24 forward, Mr Wong. So, really, what these photographs  
25 are showing, in your view -- tell me if I've got this

1 right -- is that surveillance activities took place on  
2 couplers on these dates, that's what they show, and  
3 that's all that they show; is that right?

4 A. 係。

5 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Thank you.

6 MR CHOW: So, in other words, the dates shown on this  
7 checklist by reference to photos cannot represent the  
8 actual date of the coupling installation or the  
9 completion of the coupling installation at that  
10 location; right?

11 CHAIRMAN: Well, that's two different -- I think you've put  
12 two alternatives there.

13 MR CHOW: What I'm trying to say -- a particular photo shows  
14 certain couplers or certain splicing assembly; right?  
15 Now, the date of the photos does not represent the date  
16 when you inspect and you were satisfied with the  
17 coupling works at that location; am I right?

18 A. 我都再強調，每一日我哋做巡查嘅時候，coupler嘅安裝，我哋亦都會去檢  
19 查佢係唔係--啱唔啱嗰個標準嘅，同時我哋都有一啲record photo，即係  
20 例如而家呢兩個表裏面dig out番出嚟嘅相，所以每一日我哋都係會有睇，  
21 都會檢查佢係一個合格嘅安裝嘅，而嗰個record photo係另外我哋都會影  
22 低同埋記錄低嘅一個文件嚟嘅，所以之後我哋係準備番呢個文件就從嗰個  
23 record photo嗰度衍生出嚟嘅。

24 Q. All right. Can I then refer you to one of the photos  
25 that you relied on, in bundle B17, page 24228, please.

1           Can you tell us, by looking at these photos, how can  
2           one say where the location was?

3       A.   張相本身嗰個final name係有打埋嗰個location嘅，如果你正正喺張相度，  
4           你要睇番嗰個日子去對番嗰個時間喺咩嘢位置度有做呢個紮鐵嘅呢個動作。

5       Q.   I see.

6       MR PENNICOTT: Sir, could I also point out that if you look  
7           at the soft copy that's on the system in relation to  
8           this, in B17, as disclosed by the MTR, it tells you  
9           which area is by a series of annotations.

10      MR CHOW: I'm grateful.

11      MR PENNICOTT: It has just not, I'm afraid, come out on the  
12           photographs that we've got here.

13      CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

14      MR BOULDING: I agree with that, sir. It's the photos file  
15           in B17.

16      CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

17      MR CHOW: Thank you.

18           Now, without the benefit of seeing what is shown on  
19           the soft copy, can you advise us which -- what are we  
20           looking at? Are we looking at the slab reinforcement or  
21           what, in this photo, when we look at this photo?

22      A.   呢張相嘅左手邊應該就係一個連續牆嘅嘍，而左手邊嘅下方佢係應該一個  
23           construction joint嘅嘍。

24      Q.   Okay. When you say on the left side, what -- are you  
25           orienting the photo up --

1 A. 相，張相。

2 Q. All right.

3 A. 唔係，而家大家喺螢光幕睇到張相嘅左手邊，佢係一個連續牆嘅頂部嚟嘅，  
4 而你見到頂部有一、二、三、四、五，係有五個呢個coupler嘅安裝嘅。

5 Q. Right. And the reinforcement that we see on the right  
6 side of the photo are part of the slab reinforcement; is  
7 that right?

8 A. 正確。

9 Q. So it shows the slab reinforcement being screwed or  
10 having been screwed into the couplers embedded in the  
11 diaphragm wall; right?

12 A. 正確。

13 Q. Now, we also see some of the small diameters  
14 reinforcement -- well, as I can tell from the photos,  
15 the U-shaped -- this is a U-shaped kind of  
16 reinforcement, vertically; do you see that?

17 A. 睇到。

18 Q. Am I right to say that those are part of the stirrups,  
19 or can you tell? Or vertical shear link, perhaps?

20 A. Shear link.

21 Q. So you would no doubt agree with me, if we see shear  
22 link having been installed, as far as the horizontal  
23 reinforcement is concerned, it was considered as having  
24 been properly screwed into the coupler; right?

25 A. 正確。

1 Q. If I can now refer you to another photo, just the  
2 page before, 24227. Would you be able to tell us  
3 whether the photo in 24227 is a blown-up part of the  
4 same photo of 24228?

5 A. 係。

6 Q. Now, the couplers -- the splicing assembly at the very  
7 bottom, left-hand side of this photo, does it appear to  
8 be satisfactory to you?

9 A. 呢一個，最底部嗰支，即係你意思最底嗰支有好多牙露出嚟個呢一個？

10 Q. Yes.

11 A. 佢有機會係一個type B嘅組合，type B嘅絞牙嘅長度係等於嗰個  
12 coupler嘅長度，所以如果佢用咗type B嘅絞牙鐵裝入去，你完成咗裝  
13 嵌之後，你都係會見到好似呢張相，有一半嘅牙露出嚟嘅。

14 Q. Mr Wong, can you confirm to us, other than the one at  
15 the bottom, all the rest of the couplers are type A  
16 couplers?

17 A. 如果睇番呢張相，頭先我哋淨係睇最面嗰一浸，一、二、三、四、五，一至  
18 四都係type A嘅，五個個應該係type B嚟嘅。

19 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Sorry, Mr Wong, how do you know it's  
20 a type B?

21 A. 因為我曾經都有疑惑過佢呢個問題，所以我曾經係叫佢再扭番出嚟，證實番  
22 佢係一個type B嘅，喺我嘅證人口供裏面曾經都有一張相係會表達到  
23 呢個動作。

24 MR CHOW: Are you telling us that you remember this



1 particular piece of reinforcement and that is what  
2 happened?

3 A. 係，我係記得有發生過呢個情況嘅，因為喺我巡查嘅時候，我都覺得有個疑  
4 問，就係不鏽都有用type A嘅牙，喺一個地方唔應該好似大家睇到呢  
5 張相係露咗一半牙出嚟嘅，所以當其時我都通知番禮頓嘅同事，叫佢  
6 現場扭番出嚟，畀我證實番佢係一個type B嘅牙嘅。

7 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, can I just -- I would like your  
8 professional assessment, with the benefit of hindsight.  
9 This doesn't seem to me to be a particularly good method  
10 of record-keeping. Your memory, trying to be reminded  
11 of particular photographs -- would you agree, it's a bit  
12 unsatisfactory as a method of record-keeping?

13 A. 我同意，呢個唔係一個最好嘅方法。

14 CHAIRMAN: Well, you say "not the best way" -- we are going  
15 to get an expert giving evidence as to oversight and  
16 procedures, and he will no doubt look at this, and do  
17 you expect him to be impressed?

18 A. 我嘅意見其實應該係可以做得更好嘅。

19 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.

20 MR CHOW: Mr Wong, I would like to move on to the five  
21 incidents -- although this subject matter has been  
22 thoroughly dealt with at various stages, but I won't be  
23 long on this topic.

24 Can I refer you to the relevant part of your witness  
25 statement. The first incident, paragraphs 69 to 73. In

1 paragraph 70, you say:

2 "During this first incident, I noticed one or two  
3 non-compliant threaded rebars (which I suspect had been  
4 cut by a portable wire cutter, such that they were  
5 shorter than the rebar length required by BOSA) on the  
6 ground, at a time when there were rebar fixing works in  
7 progress in the area. The threaded ends of the  
8 non-compliant rebars (which were intended to be used  
9 with 86 millimetre long couplers for type A connections)  
10 were shortened by half, compared to the length they  
11 should have been. I do not know who was responsible for  
12 cutting the threaded ends.

13 I immediately contacted Leighton's site supervisor,  
14 Mr Chan Chi Yip, and asked what was the deal with the  
15 threaded rebars. Mr Chan Chi Yip assured me that he  
16 would resolve the problem immediately."

17 The question I would like to ask you is, when you  
18 informed Mr Chan Chi Yip, did he sound surprised, when  
19 you informed him of what happened?

20 CHAIRMAN: After a couple of years, though, I don't know  
21 that we're assisted by a very, very subjective memory  
22 test there. I'm not saying the question is improper.

23 I just don't know the degree to which it will assist us.

24 MR CHOW: I will move on.

25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

26 MR CHOW: Now, this incident, when you put down what you

1           said in paragraph 70, you seem to suggest that the bar,  
2           of which the threaded part has been cut, although it was  
3           lying on the ground, you seem to suggest that they were  
4           intended to be used and screwed into couplers. Is that  
5           what you intended to tell us, because you further  
6           mentioned that "when there were rebar fixing works in  
7           progress in the area"?

8        A.    係。

9        Q.    So you would no doubt agree with me that, in those  
10          circumstances, it is a clear case that someone intended  
11          to cheat?

12       A.    同意。

13       Q.    So that does not occur to you that it is a serious  
14          matter and has to be dealt with seriously by a more  
15          senior level within the MTRC organisation?

16       A.    當其時都係因為呢個事件發生嘅時候係喺我每一日嘅巡查，同埋contractor  
17          禮頓佢都即時解決咗呢個incident，而且紮鐵呢個項目係繼續進行中嘅，佢  
18          未去到一個hold point嘅，所以我有再向上匯報。

19       Q.    Now, for the second incident, you said -- perhaps before  
20          that, what was your understanding at the time as to the  
21          reason why the threaded bar has to be cut on this first  
22          incident?

23       A.    當時我有直接問嗰個原因。

24       Q.    You didn't ask, but did you have an idea as to the  
25          reason why?

1 A. 我唔記得當其時有冇諗到，但係如果你問番我個人意見，通常都係貪快。

2 Q. Okay. Perhaps I can remind you -- now, in paragraph 72  
3 you said:

4 "Shortly thereafter, Leighton notified me that the  
5 workers would start rectifying the rebars, and  
6 I personally went down to site to oversee the  
7 rectification process -- the workers used an electric  
8 concrete breaker to hack off the concrete around the  
9 couplers concerned, and then installed new couplers and  
10 compliant rebars (new couplers had to be used because it  
11 was impossible to install a compliant rebar into the  
12 original couplers)."

13 Do you see that?

14 A. 正確。

15 Q. So am I right to say that the reason for cutting part of  
16 the threaded rebar was because there was a problem with  
17 the couplers in question, and a compliant rebar could  
18 not be screwed into the couplers, and that must be the  
19 reason on that occasion?

20 A. 同意。

21 Q. So it also implies that having cut away part of the  
22 threaded rebar, notwithstanding the coupler in question  
23 was defective, the cut bar could have been screwed into  
24 the defective couplers, otherwise the steel fixers would  
25 not have cut the threaded rebar; do you agree with me?

1 A. 有呢個可能嘅。

2 Q. Now we can go back to the checklist that we have looked  
3 at. I promised you this morning I would come back to  
4 it. Bundle B7, page 4555.

5 The first four items, in the lower part of the  
6 checklist -- you remember we had some discussion on it?

7 A. 係。

8 Q. Can I ask you, when Mr James Ho gave evidence in this  
9 Commission, were you listening to his evidence outside  
10 this courtroom?

11 A. 大概有嘅。

12 Q. May I remind you of Mr James Ho's evidence given in  
13 re-examination then? Day 27, page 50, when Mr James Ho  
14 was re-examined by Mr Boulding.

15 At line 23, Mr Boulding asked:

16 "You were taken to a document -- I think it's  
17 B7/4538, and if that could be blown up a little bit  
18 there; thank you -- do you remember being asked about  
19 items I think 1, 2 and 4?

20 Answer: Yes.

21 Question: You can see that the first item is,  
22 'Couplers fully screwed and fitted'?

23 Answer: Yes.

24 Question: Am I right in thinking that you can only  
25 check that when the rebar has been properly screwed into  
26 the coupler?

1           Answer: Yes, correct.

2           Question: And if we were to look at 4, 'Complete  
3 splice between coupler/rebar', again would I be right in  
4 thinking that you can only check that that's been done  
5 properly after the rebar has been properly screwed into  
6 the coupler?

7           Answer: Yes.

8           Question: Now, let's have a look at 3, together,  
9 for example, 'Has thread been cleared of foreign  
10 materials (for example concrete gels)'; do you see that?

11          Answer: Yes.

12          Question: Now, just assume, will you, that the  
13 thread had foreign materials on it, for example concrete  
14 gels. Do you have have a view as to whether or not that  
15 rebar could have been properly screwed into the coupler?

16          Answer: It cannot.

17          Question: Similarly, looking at 2, 'Has coupler  
18 been cleared of foreign materials (for example concrete  
19 gels)', if it had not been cleared of those materials,  
20 do you have a view as to whether or not the rebar could  
21 have been properly screwed into the coupler?

22          Answer: Again, it cannot be properly screwed."

23          Now, this morning, when I asked you to look at the  
24 several items set out in the lower half of the  
25 checklist, and my question, my original question, was  
26 whether on the basis of the description here you were

1           supposed to monitor or supervise the couplers  
2           installation process. Your original answer was "yes",  
3           but subsequently you went on to say something along the  
4           line as Mr James Ho said in re-examination. Do you  
5           recall that?

6           A. 記得。

7           Q. We have just now looked at the first incident, and you  
8           agreed with me that as far as you were concerned, the  
9           problem in the first incident is because of the  
10          defective couplers, and if the threaded bar has been  
11          cut, notwithstanding the defective couplers, the cut bar  
12          can still be screwed into the couplers; do you recall  
13          that?

14          A. 有機會可以扭到入去嘅。

15          Q. So am I right in thinking that the reason why you were  
16          specifically -- or those four items were separately set  
17          out in the checklist, one of the reasons is to avoid  
18          exactly the kind of situation that happened in the first  
19          incident, which is to monitor and supervise the  
20          installation process, to avoid the possibility that any  
21          cut rebar could have been screwed into defective  
22          couplers? Do you agree with me?

23          A. 同意。

24          Q. In the third incident, and the fourth and fifth  
25          incidents, your evidence set out in your witness  
26          statement suggest that they are of a similar nature; do

1           you recall that?

2       A.   記得。

3       Q.   It would suggest to you that someone who intended to  
4           cheat on the first incident, similar intention to cheat  
5           actually did not stop; it continued?

6       A.   唔好意思，可唔可以重複？

7       Q.   In the first incident -- you agreed with me already --  
8           the conduct by whoever it was actually has an element of  
9           deception, trying to cheat MTRC or Leighton, we don't  
10          know, so -- do you agree with me?

11      A.   佢第一次--因為我有問究竟真實嘅原因，第一次嘅incident嘅出現就一定  
12          會係一個唔合規格嘅安裝，佢係咪有心欺騙呢，呢個我唔知道。

13      Q.   Mr Wong, we are just normal human beings. Given the  
14          fact someone cut short part of the threaded end with  
15          an intention to use it and screw into a defective  
16          coupler -- well, it appears to me it won't be difficult  
17          for somebody to form an opinion that that person,  
18          whoever it was, intended to cheat.

19      A.   或者我再講番喺第一次嘅incident，我係發現到唔合規格嘅絞牙螺絲鐵就放  
20          咗喺一個現場，而附近係做緊一個紮鐵工程，我就睇唔到佢係擺個唔合規格  
21          嘅鋼筋裝入去嘅，所以我就即刻諮詢番禮頓嘅前線人員。

22      Q.   Now, Mr Wong, if I may recall to you what you just said,  
23          the transcript of today at [draft] page 68, line 1 -- my  
24          question was:

25                "So you would no doubt agree with me that, in those



1           circumstances, it is a clear case that someone intended  
2           to cheat?

3           Answer: I agree."

4           Wasn't it your answer?

5       A.   因為佢背後呢個工人嗰個動機，我有問嗰個原因，所以佢係有心去呢定係佢係  
6           唔知道嗰個要求而做呢個動作，所以我唔可以去評價剪鐵嗰個工人佢嗰個意圖。

7       Q.   Right. Let's go on. Now, do you agree with me that  
8           Leighton's inspectors or supervisors would have spent  
9           more time on site supervising the work than the staff of  
10          MTRC?

11      A.   可以咁講。

12      Q.   From what you describe as to what happened in the five  
13          incidents, it appears to me, at least, on each occasion  
14          it was your team who discovered the non-compliances. It  
15          was never Leighton's on-site supervisors; is that  
16          correct?

17      A.   或者我補充少少，我自己有發現嗰五次，但係禮頓嘅supervisor佢自己有  
18          冇發現，我有問到嘅，佢發現咗，佢自己有冇去糾正呢，我亦都有問到仔細  
19          呢啲問題，佢都唔需要交代畀我聽佢搵到類似嘅事件、佢已經修正好。

20      Q.   In relation to these five incidents that you mention,  
21          they were discovered by you or your team members; right?

22      A.   正確。

23      Q.   Since Leighton's staff spent more time on site than your  
24          team, and further given that for these five incidents  
25          that we know of, each and every time it was you or your

1 team member that discovered it, has it ever occurred to  
2 you that the problem might be much more widespread  
3 on site, not isolated incidents?

4 A. 當其時我有問禮頓究竟佢自己有冇發現咗類似嘅事件嘅。

5 Q. Right. Let's move on.

6 Am I right to say that you managed to spot these  
7 five incidents of non-compliance, it's because every  
8 time you either discover there is a gap between the cut  
9 ends of the bar at the couplers, or you see a cut bar  
10 lying on the floor?

11 A. 係。

12 Q. So am I right in thinking that if any cut bars had been  
13 screwed into couplers, you would not have been able to  
14 spot those non-compliant splicing assemblies?

15 A. 如果佢裝嵌完成之後，佢係露番啲個牙出嚟係少過1至1.5道牙，係合資格嘅，  
16 佢之前有冇做一啲其他嘅treatment或者盛呢，要睇下當其時有冇成個過程  
17 會喺度睇住佢做，先至可以睇得到嘅。

18 Q. Now, this morning you mentioned to us your normal  
19 working hours; do you recall that?

20 A. 記得。

21 Q. You said from 9.30 to 5 pm; right?

22 A. 係，冇錯。

23 Q. Now, we have evidence that occasionally the steel fixers  
24 may work overtime; you were aware of that too, right?

25 A. 知道。

1 Q. Can I assume that on those occasions, you were not  
2 required to stay behind to look at their work; right?

3 A. 本人冇去加班，我有安排其他同事去做嗰個overnight嗰個巡查嘅。

4 Q. There is evidence from Mr Jason Poon who told this  
5 Commission, under paragraph 42 of his statement -- for  
6 the purposes of the record, it's bundle D1, page 22 --  
7 he said after September these activities, namely cutting  
8 the threaded part of the bar, were carried out at night.

9 Do you think this was possible, for this kind of  
10 activity being carried out at night and not noticed?

11 A. 即係你意思，你問我嘅估計呢啲動作會唔會--如果其實你--我個人意見，  
12 呢啲動作其實唔需要，如果佢要做嘅，其實幾時佢都會做嘅。不過如果佢  
13 夜晚有機會做嘅，可能就係因為比較少其他嘅巡查，因為喺6點之後我哋  
14 嘅inspector係只會安排咗一位同事巡查晒整個範圍，由area A去到  
15 area C，嗰個係同事嘅數量話比較少嘅，喺6點之後，夜晚。

16 Q. Lastly, I would like simply to follow up on one of the  
17 questions raised by Mr Chairman this morning.

18 Earlier on, when Mr Chairman asked you whether you  
19 were happy to sign on the set of retrospective records,  
20 when you were asked by your senior to do so, your answer  
21 was you were happy. Do you recall that?

22 A. 我明白。我反而想補充少少，我樂意去簽係樂意簽大家手頭上睇到嗰份  
23 retrospective嘅internal嘅record，係我唔樂意簽係禮頓提供嗰  
24 一份嘅圖。

25 Q. Now, if the retrospective record was prepared by

1           Leighton, you were unwilling to sign, but if it was  
2           prepared by MTRC, you have no problem in signing; right?  
3           Is that what you are telling us?

4           A.   因為呢個係for我internal, for我哋自己一個內部文件, 就唔係嗰個QSP  
5           所提及嘅appendix B, 所以我唔介意去準備番呢個紀錄。

6           Q.   I see. Can you take a look at paragraph 52 of your  
7           witness statement, page 433, please, where you said:

8                    "Afterwards, Mr James Ho told me that Leighton had  
9           by then retrospectively prepared a set of record sheets  
10          for the EWL slab, although I had not actually seen  
11          a physical copy at the time. He asked me whether I was  
12          willing to countersign those record sheets, and  
13          I vehemently said that I was not willing to do so in  
14          these circumstances when Leighton had failed to keep any  
15          contemporaneous record sheets as required by the QSP."

16          So the way I read what you said in this statement is  
17          your particular objection is because Leighton failed to  
18          keep any contemporaneous records as required by the QSP;  
19          right?

20          A.   正確, 正確。

21          Q.   So, from your point of view as a senior inspector of  
22          works, you will agree with me, no doubt, proper keeping  
23          of contemporaneous records is important for the purpose  
24          of ensuring quality control/quality assurance; right?

25          A.   同意。

1 Q. And that's exactly why we need a proper record-keeping  
2 requirement under the QSP; agree?

3 A. 同意。

4 Q. Right. But when you were asked to sign on the  
5 retrospective records prepared by your company, MTRC,  
6 you knew that they were prepared without the benefit  
7 of relevant contemporaneous records; right?

8 A. 當其時我準備呢一個retrospective嘅record嘅時候，我只係有一個  
9 record photo，所以當其時我都好清晰咁話畀我上司聽，首先，我  
10 唔係個QSP裏面嗰位T3，我只能夠提供呢啲相關嘅record photo。同  
11 埋如果要準備番個文件，我相信一定係一個內部嘅文件嚟嘅。

12 Q. Am I right to say that you ought to have the same  
13 concern when you signed on the set of checklists  
14 prepared by Derek Ma, instead of happily signing on it;  
15 right? Because those set of documents were not  
16 contemporaneous records. Do you agree?

17 A. 所以馬先生提供呢個表格畀我嘅時候，佢都好清晰就話畀我聽呢個係一個  
18 retrospective嘅內部文件。

19 Q. Ah. Actually, I recall what you said this morning is so  
20 long as there is something on the face of the document  
21 saying that it is retrospective, then you find it okay  
22 to sign at some later date; do you recall that?

23 A. 我今朝所提及嘅retrospective record，因為馬先生亦都有提及，一定  
24 唔會話簽番去2015年嘅。

25 Q. Can I just ask my last question, I promise. When you

1           were asked by Mr James Ho as to whether you are willing  
2           to sign on a set of retrospective records prepared by  
3           Leighton, you told us that at that point Mr James Ho did  
4           not show you the retrospective records that he was  
5           talking about; right? Do you recall that?

6       A.    係。

7       Q.    So you never found out whether Leighton has put a kind  
8           of note, just like what you have done, on the set of  
9           retrospective records, telling the whole world that this  
10          document was made retrospectively? You never bothered  
11          to find out; right? You simply rejected to sign on it?

12      A.    係我直接答番何先生話我唔會簽番禮頓嘅record。

13      Q.    Why?

14      A.    因為都係嗰幾個原因，就我唔係被指派嗰位T3。

15      Q.    That is the only reason; right?

16      A.    係喇，我當其時--可唔可以繼續講？

17      Q.    Yes.

18      A.    當其時我話畀佢聽我唔會簽番同埋countersign番禮頓提供嘅一啲record，  
19          因為當其時喺2015年嘅時候佢冇搵過出嚟，同埋我話畀佢聽我都唔係嗰個  
20          QSP裏面所指派嘅T3。

21      MR CHOW: Thank you, Mr Wong. I have no more questions for  
22          you.

23                Mr Chairman, I have no more questions.

24      CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

25      MR SO: Sir, I apologise, I do understand that China

1 Technology did indicate earlier that we have no  
2 questions. I wonder if we may crave leave to ask just  
3 two very brief questions arising out of the government's  
4 cross-examination?

5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, certainly.

6 MR SO: Thank you. I do apologise.

7 Cross-examination by MR SO

8 Q. Mr Wong, I'm Simon So, I represent China Technology.  
9 There are just two very short questions I wish to ask  
10 you about.

11 Take the situation when you were inspecting the  
12 coupler-to-coupler installations. When you saw that  
13 there was one threading exposed in the rebar, could you  
14 tell whether that particular rebar, the threadings had  
15 been cut or whether the threadings had not been cut?

16 A. 如果已經成功裝嵌咗入去coupler裏面，肉眼係睇唔到嘅。

17 Q. In the course of your inspection, would you unscrew  
18 a particular thread in order to check whether any of the  
19 threadings were being cut?

20 A. 我唔會全部都叫佢扭出嚟，我會抽樣，例如頭先有一張相見到有一啲type B  
21 嘅牙裝咗入去，嗰啲有疑問嘅，我先至會叫佢扭。因為如果咁樣大量扭，會  
22 damage咗嗰個牙，會燒杯喇，俗稱叫做。

23 Q. So the short answer is you would not unscrew each and  
24 every rebar to check whether any threadings were being  
25 cut?

1 CHAIRMAN: Well, that would be, would it not, sort of  
2 self-defeating? You might as well then say why screw  
3 them in if we've got to screw them out again?

4 MR SO: To check it.

5 CHAIRMAN: Just have somebody standing there watching all  
6 the time I think would be the best, which again we  
7 accept is impractical in the world.

8 MR SO: Thank you. That's the question. Thank you.

9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

10 MR CONNOR: I have no questions, sir.

11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

12 Yes, Mr Boulding.

13 Re-examination by MR BOULDING

14 MR BOULDING: Thank you very much, sir. Good afternoon,  
15 Professor.

16 Good afternoon, Mr Wong. I just have one or two  
17 matters that I'd like your further assistance on,  
18 please. I'd like you to cast your mind back to  
19 yesterday, I think it was, when you gave evidence about  
20 the second rebar cutting incident. Do you remember  
21 being questioned about that, Mr Wong?

22 A. 記得。

23 Q. And the transcript records you saying that it was still  
24 one or two rebars. Are you sure about that?

25 A. 記得。

26 Q. The transcript records that there was a debate by



1 reference to photographs produced by Mr Edward Mok as to  
2 whether the second incident was the same incident as  
3 Edward Mok was talking about. Do you remember being  
4 questioned about that, Mr Wong?

5 A. 我記得。

6 Q. Do you remember saying that you could not categorically  
7 say that was the case as your recollection was not good  
8 enough?

9 A. 冇錯，因為我嘅第二次incident，我唔知係唔係等於莫先生嗰一次。

10 Q. Right. The transcript records you saying, at page 147,  
11 line 6:

12 "For the first and second incidents, I think the  
13 situation was very similar, so on the ground, I would  
14 say. And I think in the vicinity of that, I think there  
15 were some bar bending activities."

16 Do you remember giving that answer?

17 A. 係。

18 Q. What did you mean by the phrase "on the ground"?

19 A. 我講多少少嗰個incident喇，我做嗰個巡查嘅時候，我發現到一個被剪短嘅  
20 絞牙鐵，佢係個位置就放咗喺一個紮緊鐵嘅一個area裏面，所以我就去問番  
21 當其時禮頓嗰個supervisor陳智業，我問佢係咪有問題，跟住佢就作出即  
22 時行動去修正，第一次佢去做番個rectify嘅時候，佢有通知我，我喺現場  
23 都有睇，佢係換番一個新嘅coupler同埋一支新合規格嘅絞牙鐵就裝番喺個  
24 現場嗰度嘅，而第一次同埋第二次係類同嘅，即係差不多嘅嗰個事件。

25 所以--on ground，因為我唔太記得當年佢究竟係exactly擺咗喺嗰

1 個倉嗰個--即係fixing--steel fixing area嗰度吖，定係佢係一個  
2 bundle咁擺喺紮緊鐵嘅附近嘅，因為呢個印象中，我只係記得咁多啫。

3 Q. That's quite useful, but I don't think you've answered  
4 my question as to what you actually meant by the phrase  
5 "it was on the ground". What did you mean by "on the  
6 ground"?

7 A. 嗰條鐵on the ground，我相信應該就係佢係擺喺個地下上面。

8 Q. Do you mean the cut bar was lying on the ground?

9 A. 佢係擺喺地下。

10 Q. Well, was the bar that had been cut lying on the ground;  
11 is that what you mean?

12 A. 係。

13 Q. Okay. You mention that they replaced the coupler. Do  
14 you know why they had to replace the coupler?

15 A. 係，正確，知，知。

16 Q. Yes, but do you know why they had to replace it?

17 A. 我有實際問佢點解要換，但係喺佢呢個動作出現嘅，我會估到，因為可能嗰  
18 個coupler裏面有啲異物阻住佢做一個正常嘅安裝。

19 Q. I see. Let's move on and turn to a document that you've  
20 been questioned on quite a lot. It's at H14,  
21 page 35070.

22 Now, as I understand it, Mr Wong, this is the  
23 spreadsheet which you refer to in paragraph 55 of your  
24 witness statement; that's correct, isn't it?

25 A. 係。

1 Q. Did you prepare this yourself, Mr Wong?

2 A. 正確。

3 Q. Across the top of the document, we've got a bar, and do  
4 you see the first entry is "Date"?

5 A. 係。

6 Q. What does that relate to, Mr Wong?

7 A. 呢個日期係同嗰張相，嗰張record photo嘅相係同一日嚟嘅。

8 Q. I see.

9 Then we've got the reference to the area, bay and  
10 location, have we not?

11 A. 係。

12 Q. Do I understand that that identifies the location in  
13 which the photograph was taken?

14 A. 係。

15 Q. Then, in the final column, we've got "Pass" or "Fail".  
16 What does that tell us, Mr Wong?

17 A. 係。

18 Q. What does it tell us, Mr Wong?

19 A. 呢個資料係交代番啲--例如第一行，2015年8月3號，area C，即係EWL  
20 area C，bay C1-2，佢嗰個底鐵，bottom layer嗰個coupler嘅安裝  
21 係合資格嘅。

22 Q. Okay. And the photographs which have the date in the  
23 first column, are these the photographs that we can see  
24 at bundle B17, starting at pages 24203?

25 A. 係。

1 Q. Do I understand that these photos run through to 24373?

2 A. 係。

3 Q. Did you take all of these photographs, Mr Wong?

4 A. 如果呢一沓，係我同埋我其他隊員，即係inspector team其他幫辦有份影嘅。

5 Q. I see. Can we look, please, at bundle B17, but go into  
6 the photo file, what's termed the photo file. Can we  
7 open it? No, that's not the correct file.

8 Yes, that's the one. In this photo file, do we see  
9 the specific area in which the photos were taken?

10 A. 呢一張相個final name其實好清晰一早就係打咗area C3-3嘅，所以我  
11 第一張相為例，佢--呢張相影到嘅位置就係C3-3嘅，其他啲都係。

12 Q. I see. So if we go back to H35070 -- thank you -- and  
13 let's go down the left-hand side, and do you see that  
14 you've got two entries for 2 October 2015?

15 A. 係，睇到。

16 Q. If we go to the second one, for the EWL C, C2-3 western  
17 wall, am I right in thinking that that would be photo  
18 B17/24211? It's the bottom right-hand corner.

19 Now, we can see the photo, but in order to establish  
20 the area I fear we need to go back to the photo folder  
21 in bundle B17.

22 MR PENNICOTT: It's on the screen.

23 MR BOULDING: I see. Can you see it relates to C2-3?

24 A. 睇到，因為如果要影到一張相影到咁detail，我哋影相，一定會影一個好近  
25 嘅近鏡，例如就而家睇緊呢一張相B24211，所以近鏡嘅時候，就大家其實就

1 睇唔到你嗰個背景，其實就推算唔到嘅，所以我哋喺嗰個相嘅final name  
2 嗰度亦都會打番嗰個真實嘅位置嘅。

3 如果大家都覺得嗰個打落去嗰個位置唔可信，其實可以推斷番張相當其  
4 時嘅日子，加埋呢兩樣，其實就一定會係冇錯嘅。所以影呢啲比較仔細嘅相  
5 嘅時候，會有一啲好近鏡嘅相，或者跟住可能會補多一張遠景嘅，去推證番  
6 嗰張相係同一個位置、同一日影嘅。

7 Q. Do I take it that you are satisfied that the photo at  
8 B24211 is the photo that is referred to on H35070, the  
9 second entry of 2 October 2015?

10 A. 正確。

11 Q. Now, do you know whose hand or fingers can be seen in  
12 that photo, Mr Wong?

13 A. 嗰隻手指係我嘅。

14 Q. Can you tell me what you're doing there, Mr Wong?

15 A. 呢一張相嗰隻手就係揸住一把尺，就去睇番而家呢張相一個垂直嘅鋼筋安裝  
16 佢露番出嚟嘅牙數，呢個應該係一個type B嘅connection，所以佢嗰個長  
17 度，睇到番嗰把尺係應該大約有50毫米嘅。所以呢個動作就係證明咗我係去  
18 睇番佢嗰個安裝係合格。

19 Q. Does that explain why you have put the word "Pass" in  
20 the last column of H35070?

21 A. 冇錯，正確，因為如果大家睇到拍咗尺嗰一條垂直鋼筋，跟住再望番去之後  
22 所有露出嚟嗰個長度都係大致一樣嘅，所以得出呢個結論喺呢個H35070呢個  
23 表裏面EWL C2-3嘅安裝係合格嘅。

24 Q. I see. You tell us you carried out these inspections.

1 Do I understand correctly that these inspections to  
2 check the couplers were carried out progressively, day  
3 by day, over a period of time?

4 A. 正確。

5 Q. Why did you carry out these inspections of the couplers  
6 day by day, over a period of time? Can you explain to  
7 the Chairman and the professor why you adopted that  
8 approach, please?

9 A. 因為佢係紮鐵工序裏面，佢唔係連續性不停咁樣去做嗰個螺絲帽安裝嘅，例  
10 如佢而家喺一個西裝上面做一個垂直嘅絞牙安裝，佢好多時或者有機會係去  
11 到兩日後或者三日後先至開始做嗰個底浸嘅安裝嘅。

12 而底浸安裝完，佢安裝完coupler，佢係會做一個鋼筋嘅紮鐵，即係  
13 steel fixing，佢紮底浸嘅時候，亦已經就有咗嗰個絞牙鐵嘅安裝，因為  
14 佢係要紮咗個through bar鐵，然後佢可能佢會繼續B1完成，就去到B2，  
15 B2亦都係會--只係會喺最早期先至會有嗰個絞牙安裝出現嘅，裝完之後，又  
16 要等到佢B2嘅鋼筋紮完，佢先--如此類推嘅。

17 所以唔會係一段時間每一刻都係做緊嗰個安裝接駁嘅，佢只係每一日特  
18 定某一段時間先至會有呢個動作出現。所以我係需要每一日都去留意佢嗰個  
19 安裝嗰個情況。

20 Q. If we were to stay with this entry for the time being  
21 and go to B24212, am I right in thinking that that's  
22 a close-up of the photo we looked at a couple of moments  
23 ago?

24 A. 正確。

1 Q. And again, on the basis of what you have recorded in  
2 that photograph, do I understand that you concluded that  
3 the word "Pass" should go in the far right-hand column  
4 of the document at H35070?

5 A. 正確。

6 Q. Just to try one more, if we look at the entry -- let's  
7 go up -- 35070 for a moment -- let's go up to the entry  
8 of 15 September 2015.

9 Have you found that?

10 A. 係。

11 Q. We can see that that relates to the EWL, area C,  
12 bay C1-4; correct?

13 A. 係。

14 Q. But here do I understand that you are inspecting the  
15 eastern diaphragm wall bottom layer?

16 A. 正確。

17 Q. If we go to the photo folder in B17, and look for photo  
18 B24231 -- if we can just see the caption at the bottom,  
19 please. Can you move the photo up a bit, please. The  
20 other way, please. I want to see the area it relates  
21 to, please. It was on the earlier photo.

22 MR PENNICOTT: That's it.

23 MR BOULDING: Do you see there "C1-4"; do you see that  
24 caption there, Mr Wong?

25 A. 係。

1 Q. Does this show you that this photo, with a date of  
2 15 September 2015, is a photo which relates to the entry  
3 of the same date in document H35070?

4 A. 正確。

5 Q. If we scroll through to photograph B24239, do we see  
6 a further seven photographs taken of the same area on  
7 the same day?

8 A. 正確。

9 Q. For present purposes, I'd like to go to photo B24232.

10 A. 係。

11 Q. Can you describe to the Commissioners, Mr Wong, what  
12 we're looking at here?

13 A. 呢張相影到嘅係一個連續牆嘅鋼筋同埋嗰個coupler嘅接駁嘅，如果大家睇  
14 番最底部，張相嘅右手邊就係連續牆嚟嘅，佢而家駁番出嚟應該就係畀EWL  
15 slab嘅絞牙鐵，最底開始，最底有隻coupler，佢係做咗個安裝，嗰個我哋  
16 係叫做B1；跟住就再上一個coupler，佢嗰個浸數係B3；如此類推，最高而  
17 家喺張相見到最面嗰浸就係B5嘅。喺呢一張相亦都睇得到佢安裝係合資格完  
18 成未呢，佢每一條鐵佢扭入去coupler剩番出嚟嘅牙數都少過一個牙嘅，所  
19 以呢一張相表達咗佢嗰個絞牙鐵嘅安裝係合資格嘅。

20 Q. I see.

21 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Sorry, can I interrupt at this  
22 point, because I'm trying to understand this photograph,  
23 and it may help me, Mr Wong, if you can tell me what  
24 those red strips and the blue strips are on the right;  
25 what are those?



1 A. 紅色嗰條係hydrophilic strip, 藍色嗰條係regROUTABLE trip。

2 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Okay. So are they running  
3 vertically or horizontally?

4 A. 紅色同埋藍色係horizontal, 打橫。

5 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: So therefore do we need to turn this  
6 photo through 90 degrees -- that's better. Now  
7 I understand.

8 A. 呢個--係喇, 呢個角度就係我哋畀低頭望嗰個角度嚟喇。

9 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Okay. That's better and clearer for  
10 me. Thank you very much.

11 MR BOULDING: Okay. Again we see, do we not, that you've  
12 got a "Pass" against this particular area in the  
13 document at H35070?

14 A. 係。

15 Q. You were also asked questions about retrospective  
16 records in the context of why they were dated February  
17 2017. Do you remember being asked questions about that  
18 date?

19 A. 記得。

20 Q. And in answering various questions, including questions  
21 to the Chairman, you said -- and this is, for example,  
22 [draft] page 39 of the transcript -- that you understood  
23 that you should not backdate the records to 2015. Do  
24 you remember giving that answer?

25 A. 係, 係, 記得。

1 Q. Can you explain to me why you had that understanding,  
2 namely that they shouldn't be backdated to 2015?

3 A. 因為呢一個文件喺2015年嘅時候就有出現過嘅，我哋準備番呢一份文件嘅時  
4 候，係唔應該寫番當其時個日子嘅，所以經過討論，問番嗰個retrospective  
5 record究竟係其實需要寫番幾時，所以會結論番返嚟，就寫番係2017年，  
6 所以我都係重點就係嗰個記錄係唔應該寫2015年嘅。

7 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, can you help me: why not 2015?

8 A. 我唔可以話番畀人--即係呢個retrospective record好明顯佢係一個  
9 之後準備番嘅record嚟嘅，所以日子係唔會係喺當其時進行呢個巡查嘅時  
10 候嘅日子嚟嘅。

11 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

12 MR BOULDING: I think the transcript has misrecorded that  
13 for the time being. Am I right in saying that you said  
14 it's clearly something that you shouldn't prepare after  
15 the works? Is that what you said?

16 A. 係唔應該喺--寫番去2015年嘅，因為呢個record唔係喺2015年準備嘅。

17 Q. Okay. Thank you.

18 CHAIRMAN: Well, the record was not prepared in February  
19 2017, was it?

20 A. 係，因為當其時我本身已經調離咗呢個project division呢個department，  
21 同埋我都第一次簽番呢啲retrospective record，所以我問番我嘅上司  
22 同馬生，其實嗰個日子究竟係要寫番邊日，大家得出個結論就係攞嚟--去番  
23 2017年嗰個internal嘅review，即係內部檢查嘅時候去回應番，當其時，  
24 所以就寫咗2017年。

1 CHAIRMAN: All right. So that was the intention, to make it  
2 appear as if it had been prepared at about that time?

3 A. 當其時嗰個討論係咁樣嘅。

4 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Why didn't you just make it the date on  
5 which you looked at the documents and agreed to sign  
6 them? Because that was the date when you signed. That  
7 would have been the straightforward way, would it not?

8 A. 明白，因為當其時要處理太大量嘅文件，所以冇細心咁去研究究竟應該簽番  
9 嗰個日期，即係如果你而家問番我，咁正常梗係會簽番當日喇。

10 CHAIRMAN: I mean, with the greatest of respect, Mr Wong,  
11 a cynic might say -- and I'm not a cynic -- that  
12 backdating by a couple of years, that is something that  
13 requires thought, but signing the current date is what  
14 you do automatically. In other words, the backdating  
15 was a deliberate, contemplated decision.

16 A. 所以當其時我都唔太過清楚究竟一個retrospective record，因為我--  
17 都係強調，因為我嗰陣時離開咗嗰個project division，離開咗嗰個部  
18 門，我返番去幫手搵一啲紀錄，所以當其時我都問番我上司究竟嗰個日子係  
19 寫番幾時。

20 MR BOULDING: Then finally, Mr Wong, do you recall being  
21 asked various questions about your qualifications to  
22 undertake certain tasks on the project?

23 A. 係，係。

24 Q. Am I right in thinking that you're qualified as a T3  
25 under the RGE stream?

1 A. 正確。

2 MR BOULDING: Thank you very much, Mr Wong.

3 Chairman, Professor --

4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, Mr Boulding.

5 Questioning by THE COMMISSIONERS

6 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: I just have one question, Mr Wong.

7 On the spreadsheet, the summary spreadsheet that you  
8 prepared -- could we just have it on the screen. What  
9 document number is it?

10 MR BOULDING: H35070. I think that might be the one you are  
11 after.

12 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Let's have a look and I'll tell you  
13 if it is.

14 MR PENNICOTT: The first one?

15 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Yes, the first one, the one Mr Wong  
16 prepared. Put it on the screen and then I'll ask my  
17 question of Mr Wong, because I'm just puzzled by  
18 something.

19 Got it. Very good.

20 Can I ask, Mr Wong -- you prepared this sheet,  
21 didn't you? You told us you prepared this?

22 A. 係。

23 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Why didn't you have a column that  
24 gave the photograph number for each entry?

25 A. 因為當其時好趕，太過少時間法準備，所以我先打咗個日子，因為喺個日子

1 嗰度我可以搵番晒啲相出嚟，日子，所以日子行先嘅。

2 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: No, but you told us that for each of  
3 these lines you looked at a photo. That's how you got  
4 this information. So you must have had the photograph  
5 number.

6 If I were preparing a sheet like this, I think  
7 I would have put the photograph number. Isn't that  
8 sensible?

9 A. 明白，因為當其時我喺一個公司嗰個內聯網裏面搵番晒我自己影嘅相出嚟，  
10 先擺咗落我自己一個folder裏面，確認咗嗰張相係我已經certify佢係合  
11 資--呢個coupler安裝係certify，所以--但係我又唔夠時間去再編一個  
12 秊巴畀嗰張相。但係其實喺嗰張相嘅final name嗰度其實好清楚就已經寫  
13 咗嗰個地方同埋喺嗰個日子嗰度，我好輕易可以搵番出嚟，所以喺嗰一刻我  
14 冇即時去編個秊巴，因為時間太過倉猝，我要儘快完成同準備呢個summary。

15 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: I understand. So you are telling us  
16 that the photograph numbers came later; at the time, the  
17 photographs didn't have a number?

18 A. 正確。

19 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Right.

20 MR PENNICOTT: Sir, that's our understanding, that the  
21 photograph numbers, I'm afraid, were put on subsequently  
22 and I don't think they would have been around when this  
23 exercise was done.

24 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Okay. That's a fair answer. Thank  
25 you very much. It was just puzzling me. That's fine.

1 Thank you.

2 CHAIRMAN: Can I ask just one question. From what

3 I understand, in order to reach your "Pass" or "Fail",  
4 you would have had to have taken a series of photographs  
5 of each particular thing, such as the bottom mat or  
6 something like that; would that be correct?

7 A. 係。

8 CHAIRMAN: Because the photographs, unless you were using  
9 a wide-angle lens or a fish-eye lens, that would then  
10 distort -- I'm an amateur photographer -- absent that,  
11 you're only ever, at best, going to get a portion of the  
12 work that was being done, correct, at a particular  
13 moment in time?

14 A. 正確，我會影最有代表性嘅角度。

15 CHAIRMAN: That's right. So did you think of perhaps  
16 putting down "photographs X and Y through until", and  
17 give the other numbers, so you can immediately see,  
18 "I've given a pass to this particular area because  
19 there's a series of 20 photographs which confirm it"?  
20 Because you give one photograph number or identification  
21 only.

22 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: There's none.

23 CHAIRMAN: Oh, there's none.

24 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Just the date.

25 CHAIRMAN: Just the date, yes, which is the question from  
26 the professor. But it would help, don't you agree, if

1 we could see how many photographs you had taken in order  
2 to reach your conclusion?

3 A. 需要再喺呢一沓相裏面再整理番，如果你即係意思--Chairman嘅意思係個  
4 一行有幾多張相可以證實佢係pass，要需要喺呢一沓裏面再睇多一次。因為  
5 當其時我哋影相我哋會有日子喺個相片裏面，跟住就打埋個area同埋個個  
6 location，會喺個file name嗰度出現到嘅，所以我有再編制喺個個相片  
7 裏面一個numbering，就係因為喺個日子嗰度我哋可以搵得番，所以我都有  
8 再做多餘一個動作去再編多一次嘅。

9 CHAIRMAN: All right. Looking back on it now, and I've  
10 asked you in part this question before, and this is my  
11 last question -- it's a cumbersome procedure, isn't it?

12 A. Chairman意思「複雜」係喺相片裏面搵番出嚟去證實番個個安裝...

13 CHAIRMAN: Yes, it's a lot easier if you've got a written  
14 record, perhaps backed up by photographs, something you  
15 can just go to a book, or go to a computer, click, and  
16 there it all is, meeting the obligations of the  
17 quality --

18 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Supervision.

19 CHAIRMAN: -- supervision, yes.

20 A. 冇錯，認同，最理想係有一個record同埋有一啲record photo嘅，甚至  
21 video。

22 CHAIRMAN: All right. I'm not suggesting we go into the  
23 realm of video, but I'm just talking about something  
24 written down or put onto a computer, with details, is  
25 readily and accurately sourced, and it's a good

1 confirmation and, if you wish, photographs to back it  
2 up. Would you agree that that's a better system?

3 A. 同意，所以我喺我嘅相裏面嗰個description，某啲相我都有打番係一個  
4 random check嗰個coupler installation。

5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

6 Peter, any more?

7 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: No, that's all from me.

8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, Mr Wong. Thank you for your  
9 assistance. Your evidence is now completed.

10 WITNESS: 好，唔該晒。

11 MR BOULDING: Sir, my next witness is Mr Andy Wong, I think.

12 Would it be convenient to take the afternoon tea break?

13 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We'll just have 15 minutes. Thank you.

14 (4.01 pm)

15 (A short adjournment)

16 (4.16 pm)

17 MR BOULDING: Chairman, Professor, my next witness is  
18 Mr Andy Wong.

19 Mr Wong, good afternoon.

20 WITNESS: Good afternoon.

21 MR WONG KAI WING, ANDY (affirmed in Puntì)

22 Examination-in-chief by MR BOULDING

23 MR BOULDING: Thank you, Mr Wong.

24 It's correct, is it not, that your full name is Andy  
25 Wong Kai Wing?

26 A. Okay. Yes.



1 Q. Splendid. Now, you have produced, have you not, two  
2 witness statements for the assistance of the Commission  
3 in this matter; correct?

4 A. 有一個補充口供嘅。

5 Q. Well, there's one witness statement and one reply  
6 statement; correct?

7 We'll have a look at them. Let's go to B448,  
8 please, do we there see the first page of your first  
9 witness statement, on the monitor?

10 A. 見到，但係可唔可以睇全部？

11 Q. Of course you can. So that's the first page of your  
12 first witness statement, is it not?

13 A. 喎。

14 Q. Then if we could go down to page B461. There we see, do  
15 we not -- the previous page, 460 -- your signature under  
16 the date of 12 September 2018; correct?

17 A. 全對。

18 Q. But I understand there are one or two corrections you'd  
19 like to make to this, so we'll pick those up, please, at  
20 page B461.1.

21 A. 係。

22 Q. Subject to that correction, are the contents of your  
23 first witness statement true to the best of your  
24 knowledge and belief?

25 A. 正確，yes。

1 Q. Then you've also produced a reply witness statement, and  
2 if we can adopt the same procedure, please, starting off  
3 at page B13672, there we can see, can we not, the first  
4 page of your reply witness statement?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. If we go on to B13673, which is the next page, I trust  
7 we can see your signature, can we not, under the date of  
8 12 October 2018?

9 A. 係。

10 Q. Are the contents of that statement true to the best of  
11 your knowledge and belief?

12 A. 係。

13 Q. Now, Mr Wong, it's become conventional to try to locate  
14 you in the MTR organisational hierarchy. For that  
15 purpose, can we look first at B572. If we come in, the  
16 third column from the left, and scroll down a bit, there  
17 do we see your position in the MTR organisational chart  
18 as at August 2015?

19 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Sorry, does it say "Effective  
20 1 September"?

21 MR BOULDING: Yes. It says "Effective September", does it  
22 not, under your name?

23 A. 喺。

24 Q. Then if we could just pick up one more reference -- we  
25 move on eight or nine months, I think -- B576. If we go  
26 down, this time you're in the second column in from the

1 left, and do we see "Andy Wong, AIoW, concourse  
2 modification (night shift)"?

3 A. 係, concourse, 係。

4 Q. If we go to the top left-hand of the document, we can  
5 see that's the management organisation chart as of  
6 31 March 2016; correct?

7 A. 係。

8 MR BOULDING: Mr Wong, what's going to happen now is that  
9 you'll be questioned first, I suspect, by Mr Pennicott,  
10 who is the lawyer assisting the Commissioners. Then  
11 various other lawyers in the room get the opportunity to  
12 question you. The professor and the Chairman can  
13 question you at any stage they consider it's  
14 appropriate, and then it might be the case that I ask  
15 you some questions at the end of your evidence. So  
16 please stay there.

17 WITNESS: 好, 唔該。

18 Examination by MR PENNICOTT

19 MR PENNICOTT: Mr Wong, good afternoon. Thank you very much  
20 for coming to give evidence to the Commission this  
21 afternoon, and as Mr Boulding has indicated, my name is  
22 Pennicott and I'm going to ask you a few questions on  
23 behalf of the Commission, and I'm hoping that there will  
24 only be a few and that we can deal with this relatively  
25 quickly.

26 Mr Wong, for the period September 2015 to December

1           2015, my understanding is you were the assistant  
2           inspector of works and your primary area of  
3           responsibility was areas C2 and C3?

4       A.    啱。

5       Q.    You deal in your witness statement with two incidents,  
6           which you call the first incident and the second  
7           incident; yes?

8       A.    Yes, 係, yes。

9       Q.    The first incident is one which lots of people in this  
10          room are very familiar with.  It's the one that gave  
11          rise ultimately to NCR157.

12      A.    Yes.

13      Q.    What you very helpfully do, in one of your attachments  
14          to your witness statement, is you identify for us where  
15          the incidents, the two incidents you talk about, two  
16          place.

17                So could we go to B1/463, please.  If we could blow  
18          the top right-hand corner up of this, please.  Thank you  
19          very much.

20                The first incident, Mr Wong, as I understand it, is  
21          the incident that --

22      A.    First incident.

23      Q.    Is the first incident, the one on the left, and it's the  
24          one we know about; that's the NCR no. 157?

25      A.    Yes.

26      Q.    You identify essentially two separate locations for the

1 incident?

2 A. 因為都咁耐時間，我啲文件要睇番晒先記得番個位置，我有影相做紀錄嘅。

3 Q. Yes, indeed. And as I understand it we've got part of  
4 the incident happening on the diaphragm wall and the  
5 other part of the incident happening on the construction  
6 joints?

7 A. Slab to slab.

8 Q. Slab to slab, yes. Okay.

9 Just so we can see in a moment when we come to the  
10 second incident, the second incident that you deal with  
11 in your witness statement, we can see, were two  
12 locations on the construction joint, slab to slab?

13 A. 係。

14 Q. Now, dealing with the first incident, could I ask you to  
15 be shown the photographs, starting at B10/7457.

16 Mr Wong, these are photographs that we've been  
17 looking at quite a few times during the course of the  
18 Inquiry so far and, as I understand it from your witness  
19 statement, these four photographs were taken by you?

20 A. Yes, photo by me.

21 Q. You say in your witness statement, at paragraph --  
22 there's no need to look at it; I'll read it out and we  
23 can focus on the photograph -- you say:

24 "The 1st photograph shows two steel bars not  
25 properly screwed into the coupler."

26 A. 係。

1 Q. Can you identify the two that you're talking about,  
2 please?

3 A. (Indicating). You see?

4 Q. If you can point there, the lady over there will put the  
5 hand on it for us on the screen.

6 Yes, that's right. It's those two.

7 A. 我highlight咗。

8 Q. That's fine. All right. Thank you very much.

9 Then, at 7460, you say in paragraph 25(2) of your  
10 witness statement -- again, no need to look at it; I'll  
11 read it out again:

12 "The 2nd photograph shows a wire cutter lying on the  
13 fixed steel bars in area C3, bay 2. This was the  
14 location where I found one of the cut ends of the  
15 threaded steel bar."

16 Is that right?

17 A. 係，當時我發現嗰陣時，就呢部wire cutter就擺喺度嘅，另外仲有兩個  
18 畀人切割落嚟嘅牙就擺喺附近嘅。

19 Q. All right. Indeed, if we go now to page 7458, back two  
20 pages, you say in your witness statement:

21 "The 3rd photograph shows a cut end of a threaded  
22 steel bar resting on my hand."

23 A. 係。

24 Q. We can see --

25 A. Right-hand side.

1 Q. We can see that very clearly.

2 Then, lastly, so far as the photographs are  
3 concerned, 7459. You say:

4 "The 4th photograph" -- this is paragraph 25(4) --  
5 "shows three shortened threaded steel bars not properly  
6 screwed into the couplers."

7 A. 係。

8 Q. Again, can you identify the three that you are referring  
9 to?

10 A. (Indicating).

11 Q. Can you hold that up so that we can --

12 A. 係，睇唔睇到？

13 Q. We just want to get the hand.

14 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Can we have it the same way up?  
15 Rotate it.

16 A. 睇唔睇到？(Indicating).

17 MR PENNICOTT: So it's the three at the back of the  
18 photograph that we're looking at. Yes, that's one, and  
19 then to the left -- yes, that's the second one -- and  
20 then to the left again --

21 CHAIRMAN: That's it.

22 MR PENNICOTT: -- that's it.

23 A. 係。

24 Q. Okay. Thank you very much.

25 Mr Wong, can I ask you this: when you took these

1            photographs, were there any workers in the vicinity?

2            A.    工人係有嘅，但係就有禮頓嘅科文或者係工程師嘅，係我一個spot test嘅。

3            INTERPRETER:    I can't hear.

4            A.    當時我係得我一個人嘅啫，得我一個人去做巡查嘅。

5            MR PENNICOTT:    Yes, but were there any steel bar fixers in  
6            the area when you took these photographs?

7            A.    有嘅，有。

8            Q.    Fang Sheung workers?

9            A.    係。

10          Q.    Did you speak to them?

11          A.    當時我有，我就會打電話通知我上司同埋WhatsApp我上司嘅，通知有呢個  
12          case。

13          Q.    Right.    That was Mr Kobe Wong?

14          A.    係。

15          Q.    Did you not feel it appropriate to speak to the  
16          Fang Sheung workers?    I appreciate that you wanted to  
17          contact your superior, I understand that, but did you  
18          not think it might be appropriate to have a word with  
19          the Fang Sheung workers and ask them about the problem  
20          that you had identified?

21          A.    唔係，我覺得個procedure應該係我通知上司，睇下佢有冇安排arrange  
22          畀我，我先處理嘅，因為如果我直接同工人講，可能有衝突。

23          Q.    All right, understood.    I don't need to discuss it with  
24          you, Mr Wong, in any detail, but we know that as  
25          a consequence of you identifying these problems, they



1           were quickly rectified, as I understand it, on site, on  
2           the same day, and indeed you took some photographs of  
3           the rectification -- some photographs of the  
4           rectification works as they were taking place?

5           A.   係, yes。

6           COMMISSIONER HANSFORD:  Sorry, perhaps you were going to  
7           take him to this, Mr Pennicott, so forgive me -- is this  
8           the incident that led to the issue of an NCR?

9           MR PENNICOTT:  Yes.

10          A.   (Nodded head).

11          COMMISSIONER HANSFORD:  It is?

12          A.   係, 係。

13          COMMISSIONER HANSFORD:  I thought so.

14          MR PENNICOTT:  Sir, I wasn't going to go to the NCR again.

15          COMMISSIONER HANSFORD:  I just wanted to check it's the same  
16          incident.

17          MR PENNICOTT:  It is the same, yes.

18          COMMISSIONER HANSFORD:  Good.

19          MR PENNICOTT:  But just to -- one point that perhaps hasn't  
20          come out perhaps quite as clearly as it does with  
21          Mr Wong's evidence is -- as I understand it, Mr Wong,  
22          correct me if I'm wrong, in the plan that we had a look  
23          at just a moment ago, there were two separate locations,  
24          and as I understand it -- tell me if I'm wrong -- the  
25          photograph we've got on the screen at the moment is the  
26          one by the diaphragm wall?

1 A. 係，呢個係向住D-wall嘅，係。

2 Q. Yes, and the other photograph that we saw at 7457 is the  
3 one on the slabs, the connection joints?

4 A. 呢個就slab to slab嘅。

5 Q. Slab to slab, yes, indeed.

6 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Again, so that I can understand it,  
7 how many bars in total are we referring to as being cut  
8 in this incident? How many bars?

9 A. 五支，五支，five。

10 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Five in total in both --

11 A. Yes.

12 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Five in total, which is the  
13 combination of both areas; it was five bars in total?

14 A. 有少少補充，其實就應該係同一區嚟嘅，因為佢係corner位嚟嘅，有個--  
15 頭先係D-wall corner，呢個就係slab to slab，即係同一區，同一個  
16 bay嘅。

17 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Yes, okay. I understand. It's in  
18 the same bay. Thank you.

19 MR PENNICOTT: As I understand it, looking at your plan,  
20 just a little distance apart?

21 A. 係。

22 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Okay. I understand.

23 MR PENNICOTT: All right. Now, if anybody wants to ask you  
24 about the first incident, they will in a moment. I'm  
25 going to move on to your second incident, which you deal

1 with starting at paragraph 30 of your witness statement,  
2 where you say:

3 "Sometime between 16 December 2015 and 31 December  
4 2015, during regular site surveillance in area C1 bay 5  
5 or area C3 bay 3, I saw that there were 5 or 6 threaded  
6 steel bars that were not screwed into the couplers.  
7 These steel bars were located at the slab-to-slab  
8 (construction joint) connections."

9 Now, Mr Wong, first question: did you think to take  
10 any photographs of these particular non-screwed-in  
11 rebar?

12 A. 係有嘅，但係就--其實有少少補充嘅，根據我睇番啲相，應該係C1 bay 5  
13 嘅，點解呢？就嗰日落石屎，我印象中，remember，係係落緊石屎嗰陣時  
14 我影相嘅，但係就喺16年我個電腦就中咗毒，所以就唔見咗啲相，當時我有--  
15 都係有打電話通知我上司嘅。亦叫咗科文去follow嗰個--換咗啲螺絲嘅，有  
16 影相，有做紀錄嘅，但係我淨係verbally通知過我上司，冇出過報告或者盛  
17 嘅。

18 Q. Since your witness statement, as I understand it, you've  
19 now narrowed it down and you think it is C1, bay 5?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And that's because you recall the concreting was being  
22 done at that time?

23 A. 係，係，係嘅。

24 Q. Okay. I think I'm right in saying -- but we can be  
25 double-checked if I get this wrong -- that the

1           concreting in C1-5 took place on 23 December, so that's  
2           within the period that you've mentioned in your witness  
3           statement?

4           A.   係。

5           Q.   All right.  Again, you tell us that you informed Mr Kobe  
6           Wong about this incident.

7           A.   係。

8           Q.   And he instructed you to follow up with Leighton?

9           A.   係。

10          Q.   You go on to tell us that you were or Leighton were able  
11          to remedy two or three of the bars that you saw, because  
12          they were sufficiently high up, as it were, towards the  
13          top.

14          A.   喺, top level, 係喇。

15          Q.   But there was nothing that could be done with the three  
16          steel bars that were further down or beneath the top  
17          layer?

18          A.   係, 因為落緊石屎, 冇時間去再prepare。

19          Q.   Right.  So had the concrete pouring actually started,  
20          Mr Wong, when you picked this up?

21          A.   係, 係, 係, 因為落石屎嗰陣時我會100%就會喺度full-time睇住嘅。

22          Q.   Understood.  Okay.  But the upshot was there was nothing  
23          that could be done about three of the steel bars, and  
24          the concrete therefore was poured and those bars were  
25          left not quite properly connected?

1 A. 係。

2 MR PENNICOTT: Okay. Thank you very much, Mr Wong. I have  
3 no further questions.

4 Questioning by THE COMMISSIONERS

5 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, can I just ask you, if I may, Mr Wong,  
6 your job was as an assistant inspector; correct?

7 A. 係, yes。

8 CHAIRMAN: Just briefly, tell us, what was the essential  
9 purpose of your job?

10 A. 我嘅工作就除咗一啲document關於daily或者啲相入番電腦server之外,  
11 每日巡查,我個工作時間就八點半到六點嘅,但係就會一個禮拜一至兩天會  
12 overtime嘅,做到11點嘅。另外啲啲工作嘅範圍,我哋返咗工之後,就會  
13 由上司Kobe Wong有個briefing通知我今日有乜嘢要特別留意嘅,跟住我  
14 就會出去地盤嘅site巡查嘅。跟住就會留意下佢啲安全或者係工種嘅--特別  
15 工種嘅,譬如搭架,需要留意或者係啲啲工作有冇合乎標準嘅,我要留意嘅,  
16 喺度不斷巡查嘅。

17 CHAIRMAN: And couplers?

18 A. 螺絲帽,首先我就冇assign咗做QSP嘅T3,但係我本身就都之前都喺第二  
19 個地盤就做過T3嘅,我都留意啲螺絲帽嘅,我會喺巡查嗰陣時就會留意  
20 下佢哋有冇上緊或者physical咁碰下佢,即係掂下佢,touch佢,或者  
21 push佢嘅,跟住睇下佢a唔align或者stable唔stable嘅,我會好近接  
22 觸嗰支鐵嘅,或者係一路visual去睇住啲鐵佢哋做嘅一個steel fixing  
23 嘅work嘅。

24 CHAIRMAN: Were you on site, other than going off for lunch

1 and things like that, the whole time?

2 A. 係，我有teatime，冇盛嘅，我會full-time喺地盤睇住嘅，到6點前都係。

3 CHAIRMAN: All right. How big an area would you normally  
4 have to supervise?

5 A. 我個報告--口供都講，我話C2到C3，大概個trench嗰個位置都係100米  
6 範圍內嘅。

7 CHAIRMAN: Okay. So you would patrol, if I can put it that  
8 way, backwards and forwards, or stay in particular areas  
9 that there was particular type of work being done?

10 A. 係，如果有特別嘢，我一路會petrol，一路巡查嘅。

11 CHAIRMAN: Prior to this first incident which you reported,  
12 the one where we have a photograph of you holding a cut  
13 thread in your hand, had you come across many incidents  
14 of rebars not being properly put into couplers or there  
15 being anything that worried you?

16 A. 我做咗地盤二十幾年，都未見過咁樣cut嘅螺絲牙嘅，震驚係有嘅，但係我都  
17 係跟番程序，通知番上級去處理嘅。

18 CHAIRMAN: Okay. But prior to that incident, which  
19 understandably caused you some difficulty, had you seen  
20 anything at all that you felt worthy of bringing to the  
21 attention of anybody concerning rebar -- sorry,  
22 concerning couplers, on this site?

23 A. 係有嘅，佢有連續牆--佢拆咗之後，佢會有啲要做一個嗰啲shear key，做  
24 清潔或者用水機去expose嗰個coupler出嚟嘅，可能有機會--佢有兩個方法  
25 嘅，有啲用hydraulic嗰啲噴--用水去洗嘅，另外嗰啲就係用工人嚟做

1 breaking啲啲石屎嘅。Breaking啲啲就有機會會打花、打爛嘅，如果  
2 hydraulic，就唔會嘅，佢出嚟嘅效果好好嘅，唔會傷到鐵，淨係可以  
3 expose咗啲石屎走嘅。

4 佢用人手打，如果打花咗，我check shear key啲陣時，我都會叫佢  
5 換咗啲coupler嘅，但係喺so far，都有特別整爛咗啲牙，因為佢本身都有  
6 啲protect住個coupler嘅。

7 CHAIRMAN: Excellent. Thank you very much indeed. I just  
8 wanted to get an idea of your daily routine and the fact  
9 of what you were doing.

10 A. 例行工作，頭先都講咗喇，除咗安全、巡查，都係跟進度，跟個progress，  
11 睇下啲倉做咗乜嘢，或者係有activity嘅，我哋會report番畀個上司聽，  
12 係呢樣嘢。

13 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, could I -- I do apologise -- then also ask  
14 you this. When you worked in C2 and C3, and you had  
15 this 100 metres to patrol during the day, would you be  
16 assisted by anybody else from MTR? Would you be  
17 assisted by another inspector, or was that your  
18 particular area?

19 A. 跟個chart，其實就冇人under我嘅，反而我對上有個叫做Joe Wong嘅，  
20 大家都有機會會碰到，一齊joint inspection或者見到面嘅。

21 CHAIRMAN: All right. And Joe Wong was with who; MTR?

22 A. MTR.

23 CHAIRMAN: All right. And what about Leightons; would you  
24 see them on the site during the day?

1 A. 見到，見到，有機會會同佢一齊joint inspection去check嘢嘅，如果佢  
2 哋入RS呢啲form--即係RISC form入嚟，就會做inspection嘅。但係  
3 inspection就局限咗係啲shear key或者啲cleaning啲嘢啫，就  
4 connect啲coupler同埋inspection啲steel fixing就唔包我哋嘅。

5 CHAIRMAN: Obviously, whoever cut these threads, and we have  
6 that photograph again of you holding one, that was  
7 a deliberate act and would have taken not a couple of  
8 seconds but would have taken probably a minute or two.  
9 How easily do you think the workers might have been able  
10 to do that, if they were intent on doing it? Was it  
11 easy to avoid detection, put it that way?

12 A. 我需要補充，首先我唔揣測佢個目的，但係喺番中科影啲相裏面，其實  
13 我係根據我啲相紀錄，我係知道你兩個係咩嘢人嚟嘅，同埋佢當日個陣時我  
14 都有巡查過，但係就timing問題，就唔--佢就喺18點18分影嘅，我喺19點  
15 到個度，當日亦係我OT嘅，我有巡查個度，我好遺憾我唔早啲去，如果唔係，  
16 我就會停咗佢，禁止呢件事，唔會有呢張相呢啲嘢發生。

17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

18 MR CHANG: No questions from Leighton.

19 MR SO: One question from China Technology.

20 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

21 Cross-examination by MR SO

22 MR SO: Witness, you just told us that in the draft  
23 transcript, [draft] page 136, line 8, when you were  
24 answering Mr Chairman's question:

25 "I won't speculate on the motive, but if we look at



1 the photos provided by China Technology, and also my  
2 photo records, I know who those two people were on that  
3 particular day."

4 Can you tell us who those two people were?

5 CHAIRMAN: No, I don't think that's necessary. The purpose  
6 of this Inquiry is not to apportion blame for criminal  
7 conduct, or civil liability. I would be content if you  
8 were to ask: who did you think employed them? That  
9 question has been asked before and it's important  
10 because we have a number of organisations working  
11 on site and one should be differentiated from another,  
12 in the public interest. But I'm not interested in  
13 getting close to issues of criminal or public liability.

14 MR SO: Of course, sir. In that case I will rephrase my  
15 question.

16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

17 MR SO: Regarding those two people -- as you said, you can  
18 recognise who they were -- can you tell us which  
19 organisation do they belong to?

20 A. 我除咗講之外，我有相嘅，嗰個就係泛迅嘅工人嚟嘅，嗰兩個都係。

21 MR SO: Thank you. No further questions.

22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

23 MR CONNOR: No questions from me, sir. Thank you.

24 MR CHOW: Mr Chairman, the government has a few questions,  
25 but I will try to finish before 5.00.

26 CHAIRMAN: That's all right. If we have to go a bit after

1 5.00, it's all right.

2 Cross-examination by MR CHOW

3 MR CHOW: Mr Wong, my name is Anthony Chow and I represent  
4 the government. The government has a few questions for  
5 you.

6 In relation to the first incident, in your statement  
7 you mention:

8 "Within an hour after my call with Leighton's site  
9 staff ..."

10 Am I right to take it that on that occasion you have  
11 waited for quite some time before there's anyone from  
12 Leighton to come and attend to the problem; is that  
13 right?

14 A. 一個鐘頭可能冇咁長嘅，可能我講個陣時--我諗大概係半個鐘頭至一個鐘頭  
15 around，我首先個procedure就係打電話畀我嘅上司，我上司就arrange  
16 我點樣去follow呢件事，跟住佢叫我打電話畀禮頓去verify番呢個case  
17 嘅。所以就可能就有一個鐘嘅，我諗因為可能我又要--佢呢度寫住，因為佢  
18 嚟之後，佢仲要搵工人去expose番個一拑鐵，因為我唔係淨係拆個兩支，  
19 可能random都會拆埋其餘啲附近啲，搵番起碼最少兩支，因為我搵到  
20 兩個牙，起碼有兩支要expose番出嚟去replace番，因為佢仲要擺啲新鐵  
21 返嚟去replace番個個位置嘅。大概--同一日，我諗即係收工前5至6點就  
22 已經close番個--follow番個case。

23 Q. For the second incident, in paragraph 33 you also  
24 mentioned:

25 "After my phone call with Kobe Wong, I immediately

1           called Leighton's site staff ..."

2           Now, does it mean -- well, we understand on that  
3           occasion they were about to start concreting; is that  
4           correct? Or they have already started?

5           A. 已經開始倒緊石屎。

6           Q. You need to call Leighton staff -- does it mean there  
7           was no supervisor from Leighton around, supervising the  
8           concreting work?

9           A. 唔係，因為嗰個位置都比較大，需要打電話，可能佢唔係--即係佢未必淨係  
10          企一個位置，因為同一個石屎嗰個位置，佢有做緊test，或者係要做一啲帶  
11          交通，即係嗰啲泵車或者係啲concrete truck要埋嚟，所以佢唔會喺我附  
12          近，我就會用電話去聯絡佢。

13          Q. My last question is we have heard evidence about hold  
14          point inspection and procedure, and our understanding is  
15          that one could only proceed to the next step if the hold  
16          point inspection was satisfactory.

17          Given that, in relation to the second incident,  
18          Leighton was doing the concreting, and we can deduce  
19          from that that they have passed at least two hold  
20          points, one in relation to the rebar inspection and the  
21          other one is pre-pour inspection; am I correct?

22          A. (Nodded head).

23          Q. The fact that a problem was --

24          COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Sorry, what was the answer to that?

25          MR CHOW: Oh, he was nodding "yes".

1 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: You have to speak, Mr Wong, because  
2 otherwise it doesn't go on the transcript.

3 A. 唔好意思，我想聽晒佢問嘅問題，我先答。

4 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: Ah.

5 A. 我驚打亂咗大狀嘅嘢，因為佢一路都speaking，一路講緊，佢未畀個停...

6 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: I fully understand, Mr Wong, and  
7 I'm sorry, I've just interrupted you, but the transcript  
8 said "nodding head", and that was taken as being a yes,  
9 I think, by Mr Chow. So we may need to get "yes" or  
10 "no" answers as a minimum.

11 A. 我諗住有個break，我先諗住...

12 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: I think you probably ought to pose  
13 the question again, Mr Chow.

14 MR CHOW: Yes. On the second incident, when it happened,  
15 Leighton was doing concreting; right?

16 A. 喎。

17 Q. Am I right to think that being able to start concreting,  
18 Leighton had passed two hold point inspections, the  
19 rebar fixing inspection and the pre-pour inspection; is  
20 that correct?

21 A. 喎，但係我有少少補充，雖然佢過咗inspection，但係喺過程中，有人可能  
22 會拆開啲鐵，譬如有個manhole或者盛，有機會會郁過啲鐵，所以其實睇嗰陣  
23 時可能合格，但係之後可能有人郁過啲鐵，未必會喎，所以--我所以full-  
24 time supervision佢呢樣嘢，就係咁樣解。係，喎唔喎？即係你明唔明？  
25 係喇。

1 Q. On that particular occasion, do you think that was the  
2 reason? Was there any manhole around? You mentioned  
3 manhole; right?

4 A. 唔係，當時唔係，當時嘅情況唔係有人做，不過我講話有機會有其他嘅  
5 reason係會咁樣嘅啫。

6 Q. Yes. Right.

7 A. 使唔使補充？

8 Q. So, on that occasion, the possibility about having  
9 someone doing work for manhole and because of that sort  
10 of tampered with the reinforcement, that is not what  
11 happened on that particular occasion; correct?

12 A. 啱，嗰次唔係因為manhole或者點，係因為佢可能啲workmanship做得唔  
13 好嘅。

14 Q. Right. After that incident --

15 A. 嗰次之後，我已經transfer咗去concourse，所以就我有involve落去  
16 嗰個slab嗰個construction work度，因為嗰件事係23號，我31號已經  
17 調走咗。

18 Q. All right. I was going to ask you whether there was any  
19 following up action on the part of Leighton in reviewing  
20 the hold point inspection procedure, that sort of thing,  
21 but perhaps you have no knowledge?

22 A. 有嘅，有嘅，佢面頭嗰兩支係換得到嘅，換咗，有啲就喺top layer嘅第二  
23 浸，即係T2或者T3做唔到、換唔到，我有影相做紀錄嘅。

24 INTERPRETER: Sorry, I can't catch the rest.

25 MR CHOW: Sorry, it's a fault on my part. What I'm trying

1 to get to is -- given that the hold point inspection has  
2 been passed, but yet we still find problem in the  
3 reinforcement at the time of concreting -- in such  
4 circumstances, I was just wondering whether there was  
5 any review on the part of the MTR on the hold point  
6 inspection procedure, so as to avoid a similar incident  
7 being happened in future?

8 A. 我諗呢啲嘢由我上司答會好啲。

9 MR CHOW: Thank you very much, Mr Wong.

10 Chairman, I have no more questions.

11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

12 Re-examination by MR BOULDING

13 MR BOULDING: Mr Wong, good afternoon again.

14 You were asked about your duties, and do you  
15 remember telling the Commissioners that you had a duty  
16 of constant surveillance?

17 A. 係。

18 Q. Can you just tell me what that duty of constant  
19 surveillance would involve, please, Mr Wong?

20 A. 首先，我都要prepare個daily嘅，我會數下啲人數同埋知道佢做咩嘢工種，  
21 之前我上司會有briefing畀我，譬如嗰倉嘢應該要做到咩嘢程度，譬如要做  
22 bending或者assecuration之類嘅，我要睇番佢係咪跟番個progress  
23 咁樣行。我會跟住就會札番晒人數，同埋睇番安全，同埋就睇下嗰啲佢做嘢  
24 期間會唔會有啲唔合法嘅嘢或者唔合安全嘅嘢，我去處理嘅。

25 Q. Tell me this: what did that constant surveillance

1 involve, if anything, so far as the couplers were  
2 concerned?

3 A. 螺絲帽其實就本身我--唔係我嘅duty嚟嘅，但係我本身就因為責任心，就  
4 一定要睇晒所有嘢，我除咗冇checklist之外，我都會verbally去睇--  
5 check下佢啲嘢有冇合標準嘅，螺絲帽喺我嗰個範圍內，我都會睇嘅，因  
6 為都幾重要嘅。

7 Q. Can you tell the Commissioners how you would check for  
8 compliance?

9 A. 首先，我頭先都講，就visual，visual嘅意思係睇下嗰啲螺絲牙有冇凸得  
10 太多出嚟，正確就一至兩道牙凸出嚟嘅，我都會by hand或者係用腳去push  
11 佢，睇下佢穩唔穩陣，如果佢connect得少，佢係唔穩陣、唔align或者唔  
12 stable嘅。

13 Q. Did you ever watch the rebar being screwed into the  
14 couplers?

15 A. 有，呢啲有，呢啲係差唔多係日常工作，如果有做一個coupler connection，  
16 我係會睇住嘅。

17 Q. I see. Is that something you did throughout the whole  
18 of your 100 metres that you covered in C2/C3?

19 A. 係，同一時間，佢應該有兩至三組人嘅，好似嗰日9月22號佢哋當晚都有十  
20 八個人開夜嘅，所以我唔敢講話我睇足晒，但係我都會盡能力去supervision  
21 睇晒嗰啲工作嘅。

22 MR BOULDING: You did your best. Well done.

23 I have no further questions for you, Mr Wong.

24 I don't know whether the Chairman or the professor have.

1 CHAIRMAN: No.

2 COMMISSIONER HANSFORD: No.

3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

4 MR BOULDING: Thank you very much, Mr Wong.

5 CHAIRMAN: Mr Wong, thank you very much.

6 WITNESS: 唔該晒。

7 CHAIRMAN: Your evidence has been completed, and may I say  
8 it's been a pleasure.

9 WITNESS: 唔該晒。

10 CHAIRMAN: So I think we are finished for the week. Thank  
11 you very much indeed. We will resume on Monday morning  
12 at 10 am. Thank you.

13 (The witness was released)

14 (5.05 pm)

15 (The hearing adjourned until 10.00 am  
16 on Monday, 10 December 2018)

17

18

19



	INDEX	PAGE
1		
2		
3	MR WONG CHI CHIU, KOBE (on former affirmation in .....1 Punti)	
4		
5	Examination by MR PENNICOTT (continued) .....1	
6	Cross-examination by MR CHOW .....30	
7	Cross-examination by MR SO .....87	
8	Re-examination by MR BOULDING .....88	
9	Questioning by THE COMMISSIONERS .....100	
10	MR WONG KAI WING, ANDY (affirmed in Punti) .....104	
11	Examination-in-chief by MR BOULDING .....104	
12	Examination by MR PENNICOTT .....107	
13	Questioning by THE COMMISSIONERS .....117	
14	Cross-examination by MR SO .....120	
15	Cross-examination by MR CHOW .....122	
16	Re-examination by MR BOULDING .....126	
17	(The witness was released) .....128	
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		